

**MINUTES OF THE 625<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE  
OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION  
JANUARY 19, 2016**

**Chairman:** Good morning ladies and gentlemen, it is 10:01 a.m. Would you please rise as we say our Pledge of Allegiance.

The Meeting will come to order. Have all guests signed the sign-in sheet in the Lobby? If not, please do so prior to leaving, so we can maintain an accurate record of attendance.

Both Mr. Dixon and Mr. Kauffman advised that they are unable to attend today's Commission.

Will the Assistant Secretary-Treasurer please call the roll?

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Chairman Hruby

**Chairman Hruby:** Here

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Commissioner Paradiso

**Vice Chairman Paradiso:** Here

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Commissioner Barber

**Secretary-Treasurer Barber:** Here

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Commissioner McAuliffe

**Mr. McAuliffe:** Here

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Senator Manning

**Senator Manning:** Here

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Representative Dovilla

**Representative Dovilla:** Here

**Chairman Hruby:** Thank you, we have a quorum.

**Chairman:** This is the 625<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission. We are meeting here at the Commission's headquarters, as provided for in the Commission's Code of Bylaws for a Commission Special Meeting.

Various reports will be received, and we will act on several resolutions. Draft copies have previously been sent to the Members and updated drafts are in the Members' folders. The Resolutions will be explained during the appropriate reports.

May I have a motion to adopt the Minutes of the December 14, 2015, Commission Meeting?

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the Minutes of the December 14, 2015, Commission Meeting was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso and seconded by Mr. McAuliffe. All Commission Members present voted to approve the Minutes.

**Chairman Hruby:** Any corrections, additions, to the minutes? Hearing none, roll call.

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Vice Chairman Paradiso

**Vice Chairman Paradiso:** Yes

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Mr. McAuliffe

**Mr. McAuliffe:** Yes

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Chairman Hruby

**Chairman Hruby:** Yes

**Assistant Secretary-Treasurer:** Mrs. Barber

**Mrs. Barber:** Yes

**Chairman:** If there are not further questions, we will proceed with the report of the Secretary-Treasurer, Mrs. Barber.

**Secretary-Treasurer:** The following items have been sent to the Members since the last scheduled meeting of the Commission on December 14, 2015:

1. Eleven Resolutions;
2. Draft Minutes of the December 14, 2015, Commission Meeting; and
3. Agenda for today's meeting.

We have included in their folders for today's meeting, the following additional documents:

1. Traffic and Revenue Report, December 2015;
2. Traffic Crash Summary Report, November and December 2015;

3. Total Revenue by Month and Year, December 2015;
4. Investment Report, December 2015;
5. Financial Statement, November 2015; and
6. Various News Articles.

That concludes my report, Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Any questions for Mrs. Barber? We will now move on to the report of the Executive Director, Mr. Cole.

**Executive Director:** Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I would like to start the first meeting of 2016 by giving everyone a bit of a state of the Turnpike. We did not hit the Powerball, but we have some winning numbers. We had more vehicles travel the Ohio Turnpike in 2015 than any year in our 60-year history with 53.4 million vehicles. We had our second highest vehicle miles travelled topping three billion miles for only the second time in history. Thank you to all of the Turnpike staff for your efforts to provide the type of travelling experience and value that makes us the road of choice in northern Ohio. If weather, fuel prices and the economy cooperate, we may break all of our records this year.

Due to the recent cold and lake effect snow our snow and ice operations have picked up, but through December 31, 2015, we had used 88% less salt and paid 68% less in our overtime hours, which is a good way to start the 2016 year.

The U.S. Department of Transportation just released a 2016 Pocket Guide to Transportation. It is filled with facts about our nation's transportation system and infrastructure. I would quickly like to point out two of them. Only 60% of the nation's highway system pavement condition is considered good. We use a slightly different rating scale, so a direct comparison is impossible, but AECOM points out in their annual report that our average pavement condition rating on the Turnpike is 93.64 out of 100. On my son's recent college grades, above 93 qualifies as an "A." Around the nation, including surrounding states, 5%, 10% even 15% of the bridges are considered structurally deficient. None of the Turnpike's 546 bridges are rated structurally deficient, so our percentage is 0%. To keep our infrastructure in good condition we are undertaking the largest capital plan in 15 years. To make sure we are getting the best possible pricing we informed the Commission last spring that we were going to get our construction projects out sooner and we did. The results are part of what you see before you today; more bidders on our projects, and awards consistently below our Engineer's Estimates. So, how do all of these numbers add up? Fitch just released their peer review of U.S. toll roads. The major categories they review are revenue risk due to volume and pricing, infrastructure development and debt structure. Again, the Ohio Turnpike is the highest rated Turnpike in America with our AA and A+ bond ratings and mid-range or stronger in every one of their rating categories. Along those same lines, I was asked again by the Government Finance Officers Association to formally recognize Marty Seekely, our CFO/Comptroller and Deputy

Executive Director. The Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission recently received another Certificate of Achievement for Financial Excellence in Financial Reporting.

On a safety note, over 7,000 travelers have signed up to take our Districting Driving pledge. Special thanks to our partners at the Ohio State Highway Patrol, Sunoco, our Service Plaza staff, and Marketing and Communications for supporting this campaign. The increased demands on our roadway require us to work harder and smarter to meet and exceed customer expectations and to ensure the continued safety of our travelers, our employees and our partners. I am very confident that the executive staff, our managers and supervisors, the frontline employees that make up our 958 person team and our partners at the Ohio State Highway Patrol and Teamsters Local Union 436 are up to the challenge of combining efforts to consistently provide these winning numbers.

That concludes my report, Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Any questions? Great job to everyone. Kudos to you, Marty. Hearing no questions, we will move on to the report of our Chief Engineer, Tony Yacobucci.

**Chief Engineer:** Good morning Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I have nine resolutions for your consideration this morning.

The first Resolution for your consideration is for authorization to award Project No. 71-15-04 for Engineering Services relating to the investigation, evaluation and rehabilitation of four overhead bridges between Mileposts 122.3 and 145.8 in Erie and Lorain Counties. On August 12, 2015, Procurement received twenty-three Letters of Interest for Project No. 71-15-04, from which four firms were deemed most qualified and invited to submit technical proposals. Engineering staff reviewed the technical proposals and concluded that Osborn Engineering (“Osborn”) of Cleveland, Ohio, was most qualified to perform the services. Fee negotiations commenced between Osborn and our Engineering staff, and on January 5, 2016, a final fee proposal was submitted in the amount of \$203,975.00 for Phase I services. The services for Phase I include the site investigation, evaluation, design and plan preparation for the rehabilitation of these four structures. Therefore, we are requesting Commission authorization for the award of Project No. 71-15-04 to Osborn Engineering of Cleveland, Ohio, for Phase I of this Project in the amount of \$203,975.00. Commission authorization may be requested in the future for Construction Administration and Inspection Services of the Project. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the selection of Osborn Engineering, of Cleveland, Ohio, is approved as the most qualified firm to perform the professional engineering services necessary under Project No. 71-15-04, and that Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract with Osborn Engineering on the basis of the Commission’s Request for Proposals and Osborn Engineering’s technical response and fee proposal for Phase I Services in the not to exceed amount of \$203,975.00.

**Chairman:** Are there any questions? Hearing none. Please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Authorizing a Contract for Engineering and Construction Administration and Inspection Services for the Rehabilitation of Four Bridges in Erie and Lorain Counties, Ohio (Project No. 71-15-04)* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mrs. Barber, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The second Resolution for your consideration is to award Contract No. 39-16-01 for the Westbound and Eastbound Right Two Lanes and Shoulder Reconstruction from Milepost 107.3 to Milepost 112.5, as well as the bridge deck repair and rehabilitation of the bridges at Milepost 117.3 and Milepost 118.1, all located in Erie County, Ohio. This construction Project will be performed over the 2016 and 2017 construction seasons and this work is included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. Procurement received three bids, via Bid Express, for this Contract with the apparent low bid submitted by Kokosing Construction Company, Inc., of Columbus, Ohio, in the amount of \$32,477,345.53. The Contract documents included line items for a voluntary Temporary Access Credit, as well as, a Toll Plaza 110 Waste Site Credit. Kokosing included a line item deduct in the amount of \$750,000.00 for the Temporary Access Credit and \$250,000.00 for the Toll Plaza 110 Waste Site Credit. With or without consideration of the proposed credits, Kokosing's bid is still the apparent low bid and, when compared to the next lowest bid, it is 11.9% below the second low bidder, Erie Blacktop, Inc. The bid submitted by Kokosing is 12.3% lower than the Engineer's Estimate of \$37,000,000.00. The Construction Manager, Hill International, Inc., of Broadview Heights, Ohio, has carefully evaluated the complete bid tabulation and finds no errors or anomalies. It appears that Kokosing has the available capacity in both manpower and resources, and has successfully performed projects of a similar size and nature for the Commission in the past. Therefore, it is recommended that the Commission award Contract No. 39-16-01 to Kokosing Construction Company, Inc. of Columbus, Ohio in the amount of \$31,447,345.53, which includes the both Temporary Access and Toll Plaza 110 Waste Site Credits. In addition, Kokosing has indicated that the DBE participation in this Contract will be \$2,278,530.95, or 7.42% of the Contract amount. This Resolution also contains provisions to assign the CT Consultants, Inc., of Mentor, Ohio, to assist with construction engineering and inspection services, and to assign TTL Associates, Inc., of Toledo, Ohio, a Commission Certified EDGE firm, to perform materials testing. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of **Kokosing Construction Company**, of **Columbus, Ohio**, in the amount of **\$31,447,345.53** (comprising the base bid amount plus the asphalt alternate amount and less the TP 110 Deduct Credit of \$250,000.00 and the Temporary Access Deduct Credit of \$750,000.00), for Project No. 39-16-01 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract on the basis of said bid; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission approves the Executive Director and the Chief Engineer authorizing **CT Consultants, Inc.**, of **Mentor, Ohio**, to proceed with performing all necessary Task 3 construction services in accordance with the contract previously authorized under Resolution Nos. 37-2013 for its services on this Project, and assigning **TTL Associates**,

**Inc., of Toledo, Ohio**, for the purpose of performing all necessary materials testing services in accordance with the 2015-2016 Miscellaneous Engineering Services Agreement; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Executive Director has the authority to approve such extra work or change orders under said contracts as a result of an increase in necessary quantities, newly mandated requirements that did not exist at the time of original contract awards, or circumstances that would create a life, safety, or health threatening situation or would unduly delay the completion of the Project or increase its costs.

**Chairman Hruby:** Any questions or comments regarding the Resolution? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Awarding Project No. 39-16-01 for the Reconstruction of Right Two Lanes and Shoulder From Mileposts 107.3 to 112.5 and Bridge Deck Repair & Rehabilitation at Milepost 117.3 and Milepost 118.1, in Erie County, Ohio*, was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso, seconded by Chairman Hruby, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The third Resolution for your consideration seeks the Commission's authorization of continuing expenditures for the Contract with Hill International, Inc., of Broadview Heights, Ohio, for the Mainline Pavement Reconstruction Program. Under Resolution No. 52-2013 adopted in August 2013, the Commission authorized an agreement with Hill International to serve as the Commission's Construction Manager for Pavement Replacement Program Projects, with each project encompassing approximately a five to six-mile section located along the mainline of the Ohio Turnpike. Hill International has submitted a fee proposal dated November 25, 2015, outlining proposed expenditures to perform project specific Construction Management and Inspection services over the two-year period during which the following two Pavement Replacement Projects will be constructed. The first project is Contract No. 39-16-01, consisting of Westbound and Eastbound Right Two Lanes and Shoulder Reconstruction from Milepost 107.3 to Milepost 112.5, as well as Bridge Deck Repair and Rehabilitations at Milepost 117.3 and Milepost 118.1, all located in Erie County in the not-to-exceed amount of \$1,970,601.00. The second project is Contract No. 39-16-02, consisting of Westbound and Eastbound Right Two Lanes and Shoulder Reconstruction from Milepost 186.35 to Milepost 191.39, located in Portage County, Ohio, in the not-to-exceed amount of \$1,734,923.00. In addition, the fee proposal submitted by Hill International also includes a not-to-exceed amount of \$309,372.00 for General Construction Management Services for 2016. Engineering staff has reviewed and negotiated the fee proposal and finds it reasonable for the scope to be performed. Since these additional expenditures will increase the total cost in excess of ten percent of the previous Commission authorizations, it is required under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Code of Bylaws that the Commission must authorize such expenditures. Furthermore, as Construction Documents for future Pavement Replacement Program Projects are finalized, Hill International will submit fee proposals to perform Construction Management and Inspection Services for those Projects, and if they are deemed

reasonable and appropriate, the Commission will be requested to authorize such expenditures for Hill International to perform said services in accordance with the Commission's Code of Bylaws. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED that the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission approves the additional expenditures with Hill International, Inc., of Broadview Heights, Ohio in the not-to-exceed amount of \$4,014,896.00, which, based on its accepted fee proposal dated November 25, 2015, is derived from: (i) performing General Pavement Replacement Program Management Services during 2016 for the not-to-exceed amount of \$309,372.00, (ii) performing the necessary Construction Management and Inspection Services on Program Project No. 39-16-01 for the not-to-exceed amount of \$1,970,601.00 and (iii) performing the necessary Construction Management and Inspection Services on Program Project No. 39-16-02 for the not-to-exceed amount of \$1,734,923.00, and that the Executive Director is authorized to obtain the services from Hill International under a modification to its Contract, all in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Commission's RFP for Pavement Replacement Program Construction Management Services, Hill International's technical response and fee proposal.

**Chairman:** Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Authorizing Construction Management and Inspection Services Expenditures with Hill International, Inc. for 2016 and 2017 Pavement Replacement Program Projects* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mr. McAuliffe, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The fourth Resolution for your consideration is to award Contract No. 43-16-03 for the Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation of four Turnpike overpass bridges between Milepost 21.4 and Milepost 27.3, in Williams and Fulton Counties. This work is included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. On December 8, 2015, three bids were received via Bid Express, and the apparent low bid was submitted by E. S. Wagner Company ("E.S. Wagner") of Oregon, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,189,955.40. The bid submitted by E.S. Wagner is approximately 9.0% percent less than the Engineer's Estimate of \$3,500,000.00. Engineering staff reviewed the bid tabulations and concluded that E.S. Wagner's bid is the lowest responsive and responsible bid. E.S. Wagner has successfully performed similar work for the Commission in the past and, based on a review of their current projects under contract and previous year's work volume, it appears they have the sufficient capacity to perform the work for this project. In addition, E.S. Wagner has committed to a 5.63% DBE participation on this project. It is recommended that Contract No. 43-16-03 be awarded to E S. Wagner Company of Oregon, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,189,955.40. This Resolution also contains provisions to assign DGL Consulting Engineers, LLC, of Maumee, Ohio, to perform construction administration and inspection services and to assign Somat Engineering, of Cleveland, Ohio, a Commission certified DBE, to perform material testing services. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of E.S. Wagner Company of Oregon, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,189,955.40 for Project No. 43-16-03 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract on the basis of said bid; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission approves the Executive Director and the Chief Engineer authorizing DGL Consulting Engineers, LLC, of Maumee, Ohio, to proceed with performing all necessary construction inspection and administration services to complete the Project in accordance with the contract previously authorized under Resolution No. 44-2014, and assigning Somat Engineering, of Cleveland, Ohio, to perform all necessary material testing services for the Project, with such assignment in accordance with the 2015-2016 Miscellaneous Engineering Services Agreement; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Executive Director has the authority to approve such extra work or change orders under said contracts as a result of an increase in necessary quantities, newly mandated requirements that did not exist at the time of original contract awards, or circumstances that would create a life, safety, or health threatening situation or would unduly delay the completion of the Project or increase its costs.

**Chairman:** Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Awarding Project No. 43-16-03, Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation in Williams and Fulton Counties* was made by Mrs. Barber, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The fifth Resolution for your consideration is to award Contract No. 43-16-04 for the Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation of three Turnpike overpass bridges between Milepost 41.9 and Milepost 42.9, in Fulton County. This work is included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. On December 11, 2015, two bids were received via Bid Express, and the apparent low bid was submitted by Miller Brothers Construction, Inc. (“Miller Brothers”), of Archbold, Ohio, in the amount of \$2,537,130.15. The bid submitted by Miller Brothers is approximately 4.0% percent less than the Engineer’s Estimate of \$2,650,000.00. Engineering staff reviewed the bid tabulations and concluded that Miller Brothers’ bid is the lowest responsive and responsible bid. Miller Brothers’ has successfully performed similar work for the Commission in the past and, based on a review of their current projects under contract and previous year’s work volume, it appears they have the sufficient capacity to perform the work for this project. In addition, Miller Brothers has committed to an 8.75% DBE participation on this project. It is recommended that Contract No. 43-16-04 be awarded to Miller Brothers Construction, Inc., of Archbold, Ohio in the amount of \$2,537,130.15. This Resolution also contains provisions to assign Poggemeyer Design Group, of Bowling Green, Ohio, to perform construction administration and inspection services and to assign Somat Engineering of Cleveland, Ohio, a Commission certified DBE, to perform material testing services. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?



**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of Miller Brothers Construction, Inc. of Archbold, Ohio, in the amount of \$2,537,130.15 for Project No. 43-16-04 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract on the basis of said bid; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission approves the Executive Director and the Chief Engineer authorizing Poggemeyer Design Group, of Bowling Green, Ohio, to proceed with performing all necessary construction inspection and administration services to complete the Project in accordance with the contract previously authorized under Resolution No. 44-2014, and assigning Somat Engineering of Cleveland, Ohio, to perform the necessary material testing services for the entire Project, with such assignments in accordance with the 2015-2016 Miscellaneous Engineering Services Agreement between the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission and each respective engineering firm; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Executive Director has the authority to approve such extra work or change orders under said contracts as a result of an increase in the planned quantities, newly mandated requirements that did not exist at the time of original contract awards, or circumstances that would create a life, safety, or health threatening situation or would unduly delay the completion of the Project or increase its costs.

**Chairman:** Are there any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Awarding Project No. 43-16-04 Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation in Fulton County* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mrs. Barber, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The sixth Resolution for your consideration is for the award of Contract No. 43-16-05 for the Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation of two bridges at Mileposts 197.8 and 198.5, and the Repair and Rehabilitation of thirteen bridges over the Ohio Turnpike from Milepost 200.2 to Milepost 236.7, in Portage, Trumbull and Mahoning Counties, Ohio. This Project is included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. On January 6, 2016, Procurement received one bid, via Bid Express, for the performance of this Contract with the apparent low bid submitted by Suburban Maintenance and Construction, Inc., of North Royalton, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,849,489.00. A review of the bid concluded that Suburban's unit prices bid were comparable to unit prices bid for recent similar projects and is deemed to be a responsive and responsible bid. The bid submitted by Suburban is approximately 1.0% less than the Engineer's Estimate of \$3,900,000.00. Suburban has extensive experience performing bridge work for ODOT and other public entities, and has satisfactorily performed this type of work for the Commission in the past. Based on previous years' work volume and work presently under contract, it appears that Suburban has sufficient capacity to perform this Project. I am pleased to report that the Suburban has committed to a 12.0% DBE participation on this project. Therefore, it is recommended that the Commission award Contract No. 43-16-05 to Suburban Maintenance

and Construction, Inc., of North Royalton, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,849,489.00. This Resolution also contains provisions for Transystems Corporation, of Cleveland, Ohio, to provide construction administration and inspection services, and PSI, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, to provide material testing services. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved.

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of Suburban Maintenance & Construction, Inc., of North Royalton, Ohio, in the amount of \$3,849,489.00 for Project No. 43-16-05 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract on the basis of said bid; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Commission approves the Executive Director and the Chief Engineer authorizing Transystems, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, to proceed with performing all necessary construction inspection and administration services for the Project in accordance with its contract previously authorized under Resolution No. 69-2014, and to assign PSI, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, for the purpose of performing materials testing and inspection services in accordance with the 2015-2016 Miscellaneous Engineering Services Agreement between the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission and said engineering firm; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Executive Director has the authority to approve such extra work or change orders under said contracts as a result of an increase in necessary quantities, newly mandated requirements that did not exist at the time of original contract awards, or circumstances that would create a life, safety, or health threatening situation or would unduly delay the completion of the Project or increase its costs.

**Chairman:** This is a one bid, correct?

**Chief Engineer:** Correct.

**Chairman:** Any difficulty with that at all?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman and Commission Members, no, I do not have any difficulty with it. We did look at their bid prices and we felt that they were comparable to unit prices that we've received in the past. The contractor is a good contractor. We have had very good success with them. While we would like to see more bids, I am not concerned with the unit prices that they provided.

**Chairman:** They have done quite a bit of work for us in the past have they not?

**Chief Engineer:** That is correct, Mr. Chairman.

**Mrs. Barber:** They were under the Engineer's Estimate, weren't they?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman and Commission Member Barber, yes, you are correct. They were under our estimated costs.

**Chairman:** Any other questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Awarding Project No. 43-16-05 Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation in Portage, Trumbull & Mahoning Counties* was made by Mrs. Barber, seconded by Chairman Hruby, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The next Resolution seeks authorization for the purchase of seven 2016 model year crew-cab pick-up trucks with a gross vehicle weight rating (“GVWR”) of approximately 12,000 pounds. The purchase of such vehicles is governed by the Ohio Department of Administrative Services (“ODAS”) under Ohio Revised Code Section 125.832. As a condition of these requirements, the Commission is required, on an annual basis, to submit to ODAS a Fleet Plan for review and acceptance. The 2016 Fleet Plan, which was submitted and accepted, included the replacement of these seven vehicles. The purchase of these vehicles is also included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. The best unit pricing for seven 2016 GMC 3500 Sierra crew-cab pick-up trucks for the Maintenance Roadway Crew’s use is available under ODAS State Term Index No. GDC093, Contract No. RS901216, Item 30AT from Bob Ross Auto, Inc., of Centerville, Ohio, a State of Ohio certified MBE, at the unit price of \$30,911.84 for a total of \$216,382.88. The new trucks will replace model year 2005 trucks, with current mileage ranging between 133,000 to 217,000 miles, which is estimated to be about 169,000 miles on average when the new trucks are placed into service. This purchase will complete the replacement of the 2005 series crew-cab pick-up trucks. In addition, this Resolution includes the disposal of the existing seven vehicles in accordance with the Commission’s Property Disposal Policy. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the purchase of seven 2016 GMC 3500 Series Sierra Crew Cab Pickup Trucks from **Bob Ross Buick**, of **Centerville, Ohio**, through the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program under Contract No. RS901216, Index No. GDC093, in the total amount of **\$216,382.88**, is approved.

**Chairman:** Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Seven 2016 GMC 3500 Series Sierra Crew Cab Pickup Trucks Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program* was made by Mr. McAuliffe, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The next Resolution for your consideration seeks authorization to award Contract No. 4260 for pavement sweeping service between Milepost 0.0 and Milepost 241.3. The pavement sweeping service will be used for the removal of road debris accumulated

along the curbs and median barrier of the Turnpike. The bid invitation was divided into two groups containing four items each, which are based on the geographical location of our facilities. The bidders were permitted to bid on one or both groups. We received four bids in response to the invitation. The apparent low bid for both groups was submitted by Perfect Sweep, Inc., of Toledo, Ohio. This bidder proposes to furnish equipment and services in accordance with specifications and this bidder has satisfactorily supplied pavement sweeping service to the Commission in the past. Inasmuch as our needs can fluctuate for this service, we are recommending a blanket order Contract in the estimated amount of \$150,000.00 be established with Perfect Sweep, Inc., of Toledo, Ohio. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of Perfect Sweep, Inc., of Toledo, Ohio, in the estimated amount of \$150,000.00 to perform the Commission's requirements for pavement sweeping services is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a Contract on the basis of said bid, and the Contractor shall furnish the Commission's requirements for pavement sweeping services throughout the Contract term, whether more or less than the estimated quantities, as may be ordered by the Commission under the Contract.

**Chairman:** Tony, I take it this is more cost efficient by having an outside source rather than the Turnpike having its own machine and doing the work itself? Is that correct?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman and Commission Members, part of the evaluation of this contract in particular is exactly that. We are trying to evaluate whether it is more efficient and effective for us to do this as a contract versus having our own sweepers. We did have sweepers in the past, we got an extended use of life out of them, but unfortunately, they are no longer working and we decided to go this route to see if we can more cost effectively perform this service.

**Chairman:** Have we done this before?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman, yes we have. Actually, the west was contracted out and the east was still using their sweeper until it died.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Any other questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Awarding a Contract for the Furnishing of Pavement Sweeping Services under Invitation No. 4260* was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso, seconded by Mrs. Barber, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman Hruby:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Tony.

**Chief Engineer:** The final Resolution for your consideration seeks authorization for the purchase of fourteen (14) portable changeable message boards ("PCMB's") with integrated telecommunications and GPS under the Ohio Department of Transportation's Cooperative

Purchasing Program number 048-16. The purchase of these boards is included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget. The PCMB's are being purchased to increase the number of available boards to enhance communication capabilities for our patrons during traffic incidents and events. The Procurement manager has determined that the best unit pricing for the PCMB's is through the ODOT Cooperative Purchasing Program and has selected Lightle Enterprises of Ohio, LLC, of Frankfort, Ohio, a Commission certified DBE, as the supplier at the cost of \$15,054.00 per PCMB. Based upon the unit cost indicated the total purchase price for the fourteen PCMB's will be \$210,756.00. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the purchase of fourteen portable changeable message boards from **Lightle Enterprises of Ohio, LLC, of Frankfort, Ohio**, through the ODOT Cooperative Purchasing Program under Contract No. 048-16, in the total amount of **\$210,756.00**, is approved.

**Chairman:** Are there any questions or comments?

**Vice Chairman Paradiso:** Tony, these are portable to be used when there is some type of traffic incident that we are going to message, right? I've enjoyed ODOT's message boards. I think they are more prominent, more visible and valuable. How do you operate these? Who manages the messaging? How do you go about using these types of things?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman and Commission Member Paradiso, they are all managed through a web application. On our GIS, we have all of the locations pinpointed where they are at. While they are portable, the GPS unit that is in the unit itself will tell us where it is at. Our Traffic Engineer and Communication Center can manage them right through the website locally.

**Vice Chairman Paradiso:** Do you see us using them just intermittently, like today, to let people know to drive slow or are they more for traffic patterns when there is an accident or some inclement weather?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman and Commission Member Paradiso, we do not like to use them for random messaging. We use them for incidents, so the folks that are driving on the roadway when they do see them lit up with something, they are paying attention to them. Otherwise, they are blank. With respect to your question about ODOT's being more prominent, at the next Commission Meeting I will be have an ITS Strategic Plan update and Resolution for your consideration that will update the Strategic Plan that we did back in 2006 and we will look at the potential of adding those types of stationary boards. These portable boards could then be moved to our interchanges where we can notify our patrons coming on to the Turnpike of any issues that they might face.

**Vice Chairman Paradiso:** I think from a safety perspective that is fabulous that we are communicating, that we our out ahead of it and it is a wise investment. Very good job.

**Director Cole:** If I could just add a couple comments to that. First, we do use these off of the mainline. So, if some of you have traveled through some of our busier interchanges, off the mainline for non-incident related purposes, just to be clear, we have been telling people to stuff their stockings with *E-ZPass*<sup>®</sup> transponders. So, at a number of high volume interchanges we did use these to tell people that they can save time and money and that *E-ZPass*<sup>®</sup> is now available at Giant Eagle. But that is different than the way we use them specifically on the roadway. In addition, as Tony said, it is all controlled through software and our Traffic Engineers coordinating with ODOT, so one of the things that we are looking forward to and preparing for is the RNC this summer. As you said, some of their signs are larger than our signs. They can just display more information. We are proactively developing a playbook, so that we can convert a longer message to a shorter message to still get Turnpike travelers information here before they get to there. Again, the ability for us not to only communicate on the mainline, but to people at the toll plazas before they get on the road, so they know what is happening.

The last thing I will say, as Senator Manning knows and I have briefed the Commission Members before, I am on the advisory board of the Ohio Smart Mobility Initiative and I will be traveling to Texas at the beginning of February with Ohio State and ODOT officials to understand where we are going with intelligent transportation itself. Tony and I just had the conversation about the cars themselves, GM just announced some of what they are doing with connected vehicles and what is happening with safety messages. The day of people reading a safety message may be going by the wayside sooner than we think. In our investments, which we will work through our ITS Strategic Plan, but our investments may not be in bigger signs, it may be in the hardware and software to communicate, so that someone's car without having to see a sign anywhere on our roadway can inform them of inclement weather, of a change in speed, of an upcoming construction zone or an incident on the roadway. Our cars are going to start talking to us and it is not just the new models coming out. I do not know if some of you have seen, but Verizon has a device that makes your car a connected vehicle and the whole idea is adopting those standards and transmitting the data, so that will all be part of what you will hear from us over the next year about where those investments need to be. ODOT has done a great job with their signage. I personally think that what they have done to make people aware of deaths and distracted driving and the issues on the road, coupled with our efforts of education and enforcement here on the Turnpike, 7,000 motorists who traveled our road frequently taking a pledge not to drive distracted. We started last year off, I didn't talk about traffic fatalities, on a rough note last year. We had eleven fatalities on the Turnpike and since everyone made that concerted effort in the fourth quarter of last year, both on ODOT's roads and the Turnpike, things got better and we saw a reduction in fatalities and incidents and we need to maintain that momentum and do whatever we can to encourage safety and get the word out. I know that was a longer explanation than you expected, but there are exciting days ahead and it may not be the next pieces of the puzzle that you expect, but we are getting someplace. It is an exciting time to be in the transportation industry.

**Chairman:** Tony, one other question. Are these signs used for maintenance of traffic during a construction project? Is that the primary use for them?

**Chief Engineer:** Mr. Chairman, yes they are. More so for incidents, but we do also use them for maintenance of traffic.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Any further questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of up to Fourteen Portable Changeable Message Boards Under ODOT Cooperative Purchasing Program* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mr. McAuliffe, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Tony, do you have anything further?

**Chief Engineer:** No, Mr. Chairman, that completes my report.

**Chairman:** Great job. You spent several millions of dollars in twenty-seven minutes. Congratulations. We will move on to the report of our CFO/Comptroller, Marty Seekely.

**CFO/Comptroller:** Thank you Mr. Chairman. I have an update on our traffic and revenue for the month of December and our preliminary operating results for last year.

This first chart shows the monthly passenger car miles traveled on the Ohio Turnpike over the past two years. Passenger car vehicle miles traveled were up 4.1% in December as a result of the improving economy, mild weather and low gas prices.

Commercial traffic also benefited from the improving economy and was 3.2% higher in December from the same month last year.

This slide shows our year-to-date vehicle miles traveled over the last ten years. Total vehicle miles traveled increased 4.4% in 2015 to 3,001,286,889 miles. As Randy mentioned, this was the second highest amount in our 60-year history and was just 1.3% below our record high set in 2006.

The increase in traffic combined with the 2.7% toll rate increase on January 1 caused passenger car toll revenue to increase 5.7% in December.

The increase in commercial traffic combined with the toll rate increase caused commercial vehicle toll revenues to increase 5.2% in December.

This chart shows the year-to-date toll revenues through the month of December during each year over the past decade.

Toll revenues for 2015 were \$15.6 million or 5.9% above the amount from last year.

This report shows the actual and budgeted revenues, expenditures and transfers for the General Fund for 2015 compared to budget and last year.

Total revenues for the year are \$10.7 million or 3.7% above budget and \$16.7 million or 5.8% above last year. Toll revenues were \$8.9 million higher than budget and \$15.6 million higher than last year. Concession revenues were 8.7% higher than budget and 6.7% higher than last year.

Other revenues are higher due to increased *E-ZPass* transponder fee revenues and higher gains on the sale of equipment.

Expenditures for operation, maintenance and administration for the year were \$6.5 million or 5.5% lower than budgeted and \$.4 million or .3% higher than last year.

Most of these savings from budget were related to lower snow and ice removal costs due to the lack of snow in November and December this year, as well as lower toll collector salary expense, compensated absence costs, health insurance costs, and lower pension expense.

The increase in costs from last year are primarily due to higher credit card fees and higher salt costs due to the increase in the price of salt. These higher costs were partially offset by lower pension expense and lower workers' compensation costs.

Debt service payments were slightly lower than budget and last year due to higher than expected earnings on our investments in the debt service funds and the infrastructure fund.

After paying our operating expenses and debt service, the balance of the revenue is used to fund our 2015 capital expenditures.

The full \$83.5 million that was budgeted was transferred to our capital funds last year, which is \$6.1 million more than in 2014.

Since we exceeded our budget, \$17.9 million was transfer into our General Reserve Fund. This will increase our available cash balances and may be used for capital expenditures if needed in the future.

That completes my report Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** Thank you, Marty. Any questions or comments? Hearing none, we will move on to the report of our Director of Audit and Internal Control, David Miller.

**Director of Audit and Internal Control:** Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I have two resolutions for your consideration this morning.

The first Resolution concerns the appointment of Members to the Audit Subcommittee. In accordance with Resolution 42-2002 adopted November 21, 2002, my role as the Commission's Chief Audit Executive reports to the Executive Director with respect to administrative matters and directly to the Commission with respect to all auditing matters. The



Audit Subcommittee serves as my chief point of contact for this communication to the Commission.

Since 2013, the Members of the Audit Subcommittee consisted of Chairman Hruby and former Vice Chairman Balog. Vice Chairman Paradiso has agreed to fill the vacancy on the Audit Subcommittee resulting from the expiration of Mr. Balog's term on the Commission.

The Resolution for your consideration this morning confirms Chairman Hruby's continued participation and officially appoints Mr. Paradiso to the Audit Subcommittee. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask that the General Counsel please read the Resolved?

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED that Chairman Jerry Hruby and Vice-Chairman Timothy J. Paradiso are appointed and have agreed to serve on the Audit Subcommittee for so long as either shall continue to serve on the Commission as an appointed member; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Audit Subcommittee shall meet and confer in accordance with all applicable public meeting laws; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that this Resolution shall supersede the most recent Resolution No. 51-2013 appointing the members of the Audit Subcommittee, as well as all prior resolutions appointing the members of the Audit Subcommittee.

FURTHER RESOLVED that the above-mentioned action is confirmed as having taken place at this meeting in accordance with law and the Commission's Code of Bylaws and the Secretary-Treasurer is directed to enter this resolution in the journal of the Commission as a record thereof.

**Chairman:** Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Appointing Members to the Audit Subcommittee* was made by Mrs. Barber, seconded by Mr. McAuliffe, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** The Resolution passes unanimously. Anything further, Mr. Miller.

**Director of Internal Audit and Control:** Yes, Mr. Chairman. I have one more Resolution for your consideration this morning.

The second Resolution I have this morning concerns the approval of an extension of the contract with Ciuni & Panichi, Incorporated for the Commission's fiscal year 2015 audit.

The Commission's most recent contract for independent public accounting services was awarded to Ciuni & Panichi in 2008 through a joint RFP process with the Auditor of State. This contract was five years in duration and covered fiscal years 2007 through 2011.

At the recommendation of the Auditor of State, this contract was extended for the audits of fiscal years 2012, 2013, and 2014.

The Auditor of State has again recommended that the contract with Ciuni & Panichi be extended to include the audit of fiscal year 2015.

Approval of this extension will mark Ciuni & Panichi's twelfth consecutive fiscal audit of the Commission overall.

Ciuni & Panichi have consistently provided quality service to the Commission throughout this tenure. They have gained a thorough understanding of our industry and business practices and have become a trusted advisor.

Their proposed fee for the fiscal 2015 audit is \$98,500.00. This amount represents an approximate 7% increase as compared to the fee for fiscal year 2014. According to Ciuni & Panichi personnel, this increase is due in part to additional hours anticipated for the review of the Commission's implementation of GASB 68, Accounting and Financial Reporting for Pensions.

I have discussed this fee with Ciuni & Panichi management and the Commission's CFO/Comptroller. I am satisfied that this fee is reasonable in consideration of the work to be performed. I recommend that the Commission approve the extension of the contract with Ciuni & Panichi to include the audit of fiscal year 2015.

The Resolution for this contract extension is included in your folders this morning. With your permission, Mr. Chairman, I'd like to request that the General Counsel please read the resolution.

**General Counsel:** RESOLVED by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the extension of the Contract with the Independent Public Accounting firm of Ciuni & Panichi, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, for a one-year period to cover the Fiscal Year 2015 Audit is approved; and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Executive Director and the CFO/Comptroller are authorized to take any and all actions necessary or appropriate to carry out the terms and conditions of such Contract extension.

**Chairman:** Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

**MOTION:** A motion to adopt the *Resolution Approving Extension of Contract for Independent Public Accounting Services* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mr. McAuliffe, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Anything else, Mr. Miller?

**Director of Audit and Internal Control:** No, Mr. Chairman. Thank you.

**Chairman:** We will move on to the report of our General Counsel, Jennifer Stueber.

**General Counsel:** No report, Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** We will move on to the report of our Financial Advisor, Brian Reguerio.

**Financial Advisor:** No report, Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** General Consultant, Scott Buchanan?

**General Consultant:** No report, Mr. Chairman.

**Chairman:** Trustee, Huntington, Biagio Impala.

**Financial Consultant:** No report, Mr. Chairman

**Chairman:** Ohio State Highway Patrol, Staff Lieutenant Weirtz.

**S/Lt. Weirtz:** Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I am pleased to report that we had a safe Christmas and New Year reporting period with no fatal crashes or serious injury crashes investigated. Secondly, I would like to just give a brief recap of our criminal patrol activities since our last meeting.

On December 18, 2015, Trooper Anderson seized fifty-seven pound of khat, which is a plant material and a Schedule II drug in the State of Ohio. On December 23, 2015, Trooper Martin seized seven ounces of marijuana, ten ounces of marijuana edibles, eight ounces of marijuana juice, twenty-one grams of hashish, one gram of cocaine, and paraphernalia items. On December 31, 2015, Trooper Smith seized a loaded pistol, one gram of hashish, eleven grams of marijuana, and \$49,000.00 in U.S. currency. On January 5, 2016, Trooper Malone seized two kilos of heroine, which is valued at \$800,000.00. On January 11, 2016, Trooper Beyer from the Milan Post seized \$21,000.00 in U.S. currency. On January 13, 2016, Trooper Richardson, Trooper Trader, and K-9 Argo, seized ten pounds of marijuana valued at \$25,000.00. Lastly, on January 14, 2016, Trooper Malone seized fraudulent gift and credit cards and \$30,000.00 in U.S. currency.

Mr. Chairman, that concludes my report.

**Chairman:** Thank you. Very impressive report, S/Lt. Weirtz. On one hand, we are very happy about the safety record during the holidays, but your traffic enforcement and enforcement of the drug laws continues to be amazing. So, thank you very much. Please pass that on to your colleagues. We are really impressed with their work. Any questions for S/Lt. Weirtz?

Our next meeting will be Tuesday, February 16, 2016 at 10:00 a.m. If there are no further questions, I will move to adjourn.

**MOTION:** A motion to adjourn is made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

Time of adjournment: 10:56 a.m.

**Attendees for Record Keeping Purposes:**

Scott Buchanan, AECOM; Brian Reguerio, PFM; Jacob Siesel, IUOE Local 18; Biagio Impala, Huntington; Jim Gates, ODOT; Jennifer Townley, ODOT; Tim McDonald, ODOT; Todd Majidzadeh, Resource International; Dennis Golem, Wells Fargo; Eugene Spinelli, Bank of America; E. Rockhold, Bank of America; Toby Fritz, Hill International; Gene Baxendale, Hill International; Tony Urankar, MSG; Ryan Kozak, PNC; Jennifer Stueber, Ohio Turnpike; Anthony Yacobucci, Ohio Turnpike; Ohio Turnpike; Martin Seekely, Ohio Turnpike; David Miller, Ohio Turnpike; Sharon Isaac, Ohio Turnpike; Matt Cole, Ohio Turnpike; Jennifer Diaz, Ohio Turnpike; Dennis Albrecht, Ohio Turnpike; Mark Musson, Ohio Turnpike; Chris Matta, Ohio Turnpike; Joe Mannion, Ohio Turnpike; Lisa Mejac, Ohio Turnpike; Helen Guggenbiller, Ohio Turnpike; Adam Greenslade, Ohio Turnpike; and Brian Newbacher, Ohio Turnpike.

Approved as a correct transcript of the proceedings  
of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission

---

Sandra K. Barber, Secretary-Treasurer