

**MINUTES OF THE 705th MEETING OF THE
OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION
FEBRUARY 21, 2023**

Chairman, Jerry Hruby: Good morning. It is 10:00 a.m. Please stand and join me in reciting the *Pledge of Allegiance*.

The meeting will come to order. Have all guests signed the sign-in sheet in the Lobby? If not, please do so prior to leaving so we can maintain an accurate account of attendance.

Senator Bill Reineke and Representative Haraz Ghanbari are unable to attend today's meeting are excused. Dr. Jack Marchbanks, of ODOT, will not be here this morning, but sitting in for him is Myron Pakush.

Will the Assistant Secretary-Treasurer, Ferzan Ahmed, please call the roll?

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Chairman Hruby

Chairman: Here

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Vice Chairman Paradiso

Vice Chairman, Timothy Paradiso: Here

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Secretary-Treasurer Barber

Secretary-Treasurer, Sandra Barber: Here

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Mr. Coviello

Commissioner, Guy Coviello: Here

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Mr. Pakush

Ohio Department of Transportation, Myron Pakush: Here

Assistant Secretary-Treasurer: Mr. Babin

Office of Budget and Management, Michael Babin: Here

Chairman: We have a quorum. This is the 705th Meeting of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission. We are here today at the Commission's Administration Building. Various reports will be received, and we will act on several resolutions. Draft copies have been provided to the Members prior to this meeting. The resolutions will be explained, questions and answers will be taken during the appropriate reports.

May I have a motion to adopt the Minutes of the January 17, 2023, Commission Meeting? Any corrections, additions, or questions regarding the Minutes? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt the Minutes of the January 17, 2023, Commission Meeting was made by Mr. Coviello, seconded by Mr. Pakush and approved by all Commission Members present, with the exception of Vice Chairman Paradiso who abstained.

Chairman: The January 17, 2023, Commission Meeting Minutes are adopted. We will move on with the report of the Secretary-Treasurer, Mrs. Barber.

Secretary-Treasurer: The following items have been provided to the Members since the last scheduled meeting of the Commission on January 17, 2023:

1. Fifteen (15) Resolutions;
2. Draft Minutes of the January 17, 2023, Commission Meeting; and
3. Agenda for today's meeting.

The following additional documents have been made available to Commission Members:

1. Traffic Crash Summary Report, Revised December 2022;
2. Traffic and Revenue Report, January 2023;
3. Total Revenue by Month and Year, January 2023;
4. Investment Report, January 2023;
5. Financial Statements, December 2022 and January 2023; and
6. Quarterly Budget Report, December 31, 2022.

That completes my report, Mr. Chairman.

Chairman: Thank you. Any questions or comments for Mrs. Barber? Hearing none, we will move on to the report of the Executive Director, Ferzan Ahmed.

Director Ahmed: Good morning, Chairman, Commission Members, and audience.

I will start by recognizing Maintenance Engineer Bryan Emery. Last week, Bryan was one of the forty people selected from a worldwide pool of applicants to participate in the IBTTA Leadership Academy in our nation's capital. Congratulations, Bryan.

I will now provide an update on the status of the Toll Collection System.

- Our back-office system provider, TransCore, has confirmed that they are back on track to meet the July 9, 2023, go live date.
- Our roadside equipment and software provider, Conduent, has also confirmed that the go live date remains July 9, 2023.

Due to the complicated nature of the projects, there is still a potential for delays. Delays can result from many factors such as software glitches, inclement weather, and equipment malfunction. Our biggest concern remains the effect of these delays on the construction projects. Chief Engineer Matta and his team have been working diligently with our contractors on monitoring schedules. Construction delays can lead to labor cost escalation, material escalation, and home office overhead. The challenge with evaluating a delay is trying to figure out whether the delays are justified or not. Examples of justified delays include nationwide material shortage, inclement weather, and changes directed by us. However, delays caused due to work issues are solely the responsibility of the vendor. We are conducting an in depth schedule analysis to determine cause and be fair to all parties. I will continue to update the Commission.

New TCS deployments in other states have been very cumbersome and often quite late. We have seen one-to-two-year delays quite often. In 2019, we had a target to go live in early spring 2023, and we are now talking about only a few more months. I don't want to sound too optimistic, but I believe that we are in reasonably good shape, given that there are almost twenty individual projects to coordinate. The credit goes to our team not just for diligence and ownership, but for the fact that from the outset, our team created an atmosphere that was collaborative rather than antagonistic.

We have nine new Team Members to welcome. In the Maintenance Department, Ethan Manley at Swanton and Emily Morrison at Hiram. In the Toll Operations Department, we welcome four new Full-Time Toll Collectors Edwin Sanchez, Arnaldo Brasilerio, Jessica Hill, and Kyle Bromley and two Part-Time Toll Collectors Michelle Redlin and Edwin Niec. In the Accounting Department, Zach Haderski has joined us as an Accountant/Financial Analyst. Welcome and best wishes to all our new team members.

Shifting now to our Retirees. The Service Plaza Operations group said farewell on January 19th to Teresa Durnwald and the Toll Operations Department will say farewell in February to Dawn Christenson. Thank you to both Teresa and Dawn for their service to the Commission.

Mr. Chairman, I would like to close my report with the introduction of Aimee Lane, Director of Contracts Administration, Procurement and OEI to share an update regarding wage rates for janitorial contracts and staff recommendations.

Director of Contracts Administration: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. Executive Director Ahmed asked me to provide an update regarding wage rates for janitorial contracts at various Turnpike facilities specifically Service Plazas, Toll Plazas, Maintenance Buildings and OSHP Posts.

After the Commission discussed this issue at the November 21st meeting, staff has further considered the matter and developed a recommended process to promote wage rates that are competitive with comparative wages in the area for similar positions.

As mentioned in November, the Commission finds the published Bureau of Labor Statistics (“BLS”) data for Pay and Benefits & Wages by Occupation and Area to be the most reliable source for comparing wage rates. The BLS data is broken out by job description based on applicable NAICS codes, including building cleaner worker, housekeeping/cleaners, janitors/specialists and supervisors. The BLS data provides wage rates for each job description by region. For Commission contracts we look at the following five regions: ((1) Toledo; (2) Cleveland-Elyria; (3) Youngstown-Warren-Boardman (4) Northwestern non-metro Ohio; and (5) Northeastern non-metro Ohio). The BLS data also lists the wages by percentile, specifically 10th, 25th, Median, 75th and 90th percentile. This shows essentially how we perform our searches to obtain the BLS data. So, under SUBJECTS heading, the Benefits link directs users to a searchable database of Wages by Occupation and Area and you can search under different metropolitan and non-metropolitan areas in the state of Ohio. As I mentioned, we use five specific areas along the Turnpike.

This next slide shows a completed search for the Region: Northeast Ohio (non-metro); under NAICS Code 37-2011, Janitors and Cleaners, including a brief description of this job classification and the wage rates. Note – the charts are usually updated in the Spring of each year, so the information on the slide is for 2021.

In 2022, the Commission added a new submission requirement for bids and proposals requiring respondents to provide a Recruitment, Retention and Compensation plan including wage information. Our evaluation teams review the wage rates in comparison to the BLS data and present that information to the Commission when a contract is on a meeting agenda.

We understand the Commission’s interest in promoting wage rates that are competitive with comparative wages in the area, but also the reluctance to direct what an employer needs to pay its workers.

To balance these considerations, Commission staff recommends continuing to review wage rates against the BLS data, but to actually require entry level wage rates that meet the BLS data for the 10th percentile and then encouraging wage rates for longer-term employees that are above the 10th percentile and up to the 25th percentile.

Based on prior procurements, most, but I have to say not all, companies have wage rates falling within this 10th to 25th percentile range. It is important to mention that as you move up the BLS wage charts, the services falling within the median, 75th and 90th percentiles tend to be specialized janitorial services not utilized by the Commission (*i.e.*, janitorial services at industrial facilities that require cleaning sophisticated equipment or heavy industrial equipment). This is why we are focused on wages in the 10th and 25th percentile.

For future solicitations, Commission staff recommends the following:

1. In the Recruitment, Retention and Compensation plan, Respondents provide hourly wage information for those positions required to perform the services under the contract. As I said, we are currently doing this. The Commission has prepared a janitorial wage worksheet to assist all of our respondents in providing consistent, comparable information.
2. We are suggesting, the wage range for starting wages shall be at least in the 10th percentile based on the BLS data. For a proposal submitted under an RFP, meeting or exceeding the comparative BLS wage is required to receive a “PASSING” score and continue on to the next phase of the evaluation process. For a bid submitted under a Bid Invitation, meeting or exceeding the comparative BLS wage is required for the bid to be deemed responsive. So, we would have a basis to actually reject the bid.
3. Proposals not meeting the BLS 10th percentile will be required to resubmit an adjusted wage schedule or be excluded from further consideration.
4. Respondents will also be asked to provide information justifying that the wages will remain competitive throughout the term of the contract, including up to the 25th percentile for non-entry level positions. (*i.e.*, step increases, merit increases, benefits, overtime, travel reimbursement, or other relevant information relating to wages). This would be written into the contract along with the 10th percentile requirement for entry level positions.
5. Staffing and wages will be verified annually by the Commission during the term of the contract.

This process would not establish the wages that the contractor pays its employees but would verify that wages offered by the Contractor are competitive with wages for similar positions in the region based on the BLS data.

For these reasons, we recommend this process for future procurements for janitorial services. At this time, I am happy to answer any questions.

Chairman: Any questions?

Vice Chairman: Thank you for that and thank you for following through with this. This is important I think for a lot of reasons. I think as a Commission Member we certainly have the fiscal responsibility and accountability for how we spend the dollars, but we can also assume that, first of all these contracted laborers as we know are the face, in many cases, the only face of the Commission to our customers and we want to put our best foot forward with that experience. I applaud the effort, I understand the processes need to be mitigated or understood or managed a

little bit, but I want to encourage us to continue to go farther and I don't know if that means to balance entry level workers with experienced workers, let's continue to push for two reasons and I think as a Commission Member less obligated to talk about a realistic sustainable lifetime income versus a quality employee and I think though that we can equate wage and expectations to the quality of the employee. So, again I understand the bid process, I applaud the effort in trying to modify the qualifications. I want us to continue to go farther for both those reasons. I think a realistic minimum wage as well as a quality employee, we don't have anyone of our Turnpike Commission employees at that wage, so I just think it is important to consider that, just as we do with Chriss and his team as his contractors are working on our roads, they are the face of the Turnpike and we want to hold them to that same standard that you are talking about, so I guess I really applaud this and I want us to continue to look to further that.

Director of Contracts Administration: Thank you. I do have one follow-up comment that I think follows that vein. So, Mr. Chairman and Mr. Vice Chairman Paradiso, additionally in 2022 because these issues were being discussed, we did alter our contracts to allow an annual sit down and if a janitorial contractor felt that they were having difficulties retaining or attracting staff, we allow an annual sit down to talk about whether the parties mutually agree that bumping up the wage rates will in fact serve the goal of the contractor being able to attract and retain qualified staff and then our goal of having safe sanitary facilities. I guess to go to that point of they are the face of the Commission and just making sure that the facilities are the way that we want them to be. I don't believe Drew Herberger is here, he is at another session in the other room but he did have a discussion, I think, in the end of December with one of our service plaza contractors and was able to negotiate a slight adjustment of those wages based on current contract language as well as some changes due to operating costs have really changed for that industry because of inflation and a lot of other reasons and then additionally we are all aware of the minimum wage changes so the contract allows for that too, discussions just to increase contract costs based on minimum wage changes, operating cost changes, but then we did add in the ability to have that sit down and as long as it is mutually agreeable to allow them to bring up those wages and that did happen in the one instance.

Chairman: Do you have any other feedback or any feedback from our bidders or suppliers? Have they come to discuss this with you and aired any problems that they have?

Director of Contracts Administration: I haven't heard any negative comments. I think it has mostly been trying to understand what we are looking for in a recruitment, retention, and compensation plan and that is part of why we created this worksheet to help them sort of identify. The working classifications are based on these NAICS code which is a federal system that was developed for those. I have some notes from the Federal website, but I won't bore you with that, but just to help them identify what classifications we are looking for as staffing these contracts and how to present the data. But I haven't heard any, nobody's not refused to provide it. We've had some and it has been very telling, some have provided the data and the wages have been exceptionally, surprisingly low, but most of them are fairly respectable when you look at the BLS data.

Chairman: I just wonder if they take on the attitude that if you want us to pay more to align your numbers than it is just going to cost you more and we are passing that cost on to you.

It doesn't necessarily mean because we do this that they are going to out of their own pocket pay more.

Director of Contracts Administration: Correct. It is our expectation that, yes, they are building it into their pricing. We did have a recent situation where we had one bidder on a contract, so we felt comfortable going back to them and asking for a best and final offer. We had several conversations with that company and we made it clear that it is our expectation that your pricing is factoring this in and because we had a question because their pricing seemed so low, we were concerned that they weren't factoring that in so, unfortunately when they came back to us they were exceptionally high at that point, so we decided to rebid the particular contract.

Chairman: Any other questions or comments?

Secretary-Treasurer Barber: I am delighted that we are doing this and I certainly echo what Vice Chairman I was saying. These employees sometimes are somewhat forgotten because of the type of work they do, but they deserve to be treated fairly. So, I am happy that the Turnpike is taking this step.

Mr. Pakush: Mr. Chairman, just for clarification, the way I understand what your explanation was is that the wages we are requiring as part of the contract to have a minimum salary at the ten percentile level, so that tenth percentile is above the minimum wage levels, right? The tenth percentile number that you are showing is above the minimum wage.

Director of Contracts Administration: That is a great question, Mr. Pakush. I would say generally, yes. However, what we are finding when we look at this data is that wages tend to be a bit lower in the eastern part of the state so when we get to Youngstown, Warren, and Boardman area, I can't say with 100% certainty that the tenth percentile wage is above minimum wage because when I have run some searches it is very close to what would have been minimum wage and I would have to look back at last year, so those do run lower than what I am finding in the other regions. But I think you are just seeing that it's a different market. I don't know why, but that is what we are seeing is that in the eastern part of the state they do come out a little bit lower than the other areas.

Mr. Pakush: So, the tenth percentile wages that we are requiring in the contract, we still don't select based on low bid, or do we? I thought you mentioned that we select these vendors based on a valued based selection so it is a scored contract. It is a scoring process versus a bid contract.

Director of Contracts Administration: So, it is actually handled in two different ways because our statute gives us different instructions on how we can bid or procure services at our service plazas. It is just written into our statute. I am assuming because service plazas are sort of a unique operation. So, it is very clear under our statute that for janitorial services at our service plazas, we award under a best value standard and that does give us quite a bit more discretion and we do go through a scoring. We opted to deal with the wage issue as a pass/fail so I guess not as to encourage higher pricing but to make it a benchmark to then move further on into the evaluation process. At our other facilities, we do currently award under our normal competitive bidding, any

contract over \$50,000 has to be competitively bid, so those other ones at our toll plazas, maintenance buildings are awarded under lowest, responsive and responsible bidder which again in and of itself doesn't mean that you have to pick the lowest, you write your specifications, you write your submittal requirements, essentially your contract requirements and if it doesn't appear that they can meet that, that can go to whether or not that bidder is a responsive bidder or even a responsible bidder. We do have some discretion; it is not just an automatic low bid.

Mr. Coviello: Thank you for all the work and it is good to see we are putting so much stock and science behind what we are doing here. I just want to caution about manipulating, us being a body that manipulates the market for employers, it makes things challenging for employers. You mentioned the difference in the east where the cost of living is much lower and so us manipulating the cost of doing business with us might make companies uncompetitive in their own markets and hurting those companies. Those companies could be small and can be disadvantaged and we might be precluding them from bidding on our work.

Director of Contracts Administration: Mr. Coviello, I think that's a really good point and I think that as we work through this process and once we maybe see some trends we can reassess. Right now, it is hard to know. So far, I think it has been working. Like I said, people are more just asking "okay, what do you want to see in our recruitment, retention and compensation plan" and not so much saying, "this is not something that we want to be providing." But I think as time goes on, we might be able to see some trends and then alter course if it is warranted.

Director Ahmed: Mr. Chairman and Mr. Coviello, in response to the concern that you have brought up, I think one thing that we can do is as part of the process that Aimee talked about maybe reach out to these smaller companies and sit down with them before we have our next procurement so that they understand what we are trying to do and we understand what those challenges are and try to find a common ground.

Mr. Coviello: It'd be good to understand what their challenges might be and their challenges in Youngstown might be different than the challenges in Cleveland.

Chairman: Any other questions? Thank you we appreciate the report.

Director Ahmed: Mr. Chairman that is the end of my report. Thank you.

Chairman: Thank you. Are there any questions for the Director? Hearing none, we will move on to the report of the Chief Engineer, Chris Matta.

Chief Engineer: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. We have had a lot of activity this past month in Engineering and Maintenance as we have thirteen resolutions for your consideration this morning. Two are for construction projects, one is for construction and administration services, six are for bridge design services, three are for vehicle purchases, and one is for roadway maintenance materials. In addition to myself, our Design and Planning Engineer, Dan Rodriguez, and our Maintenance Operations Engineer, Bryan Emery, will be presenting resolutions under the Chief Engineer's report for your consideration.

My first resolution for your consideration seeks the Commission's authorization to award Contract No. 43-22-06 REBID. This represents a Project for repair and rehabilitation of the Ohio Turnpike mainline bridge over the Cuyahoga River at milepost 176.9 in Summit County. This work is included in the 2023 Capital Improvement Budget. You may recall we bid this project out in November of 2022 and a Resolution was adopted to reject the sole bid as it was over \$14 million dollars on a project that was estimated at that time at \$4.9 million. Engineering staff discussed the scope of work with prospective contractors, met with our design firm, revised and clarified the bid documents, and prepared the project to be rebid. Procurement advertised the project and on February 8, 2023, Procurement received two (2) bids in response to this Project. The apparent low bid was submitted by The Ruhlin Company (Ruhlin), of Hinckley, Ohio, in the amount of \$9,525,793.68, which is about 12.1% above the Engineer's Estimate of \$8,500,000.00. The other bid for the project was 9,656,425.00, which represents a variance of just 1.4% between the two bids indicating that it appears the Commission received competitive bids. In accordance with Article 5.1.2 of the Instructions to Bidders, if all bids received are in excess of ten (10) percent above the Engineer's Estimate, the Commission shall convene a Construction Contracts Award Committee ("Committee") to determine if the bid prices are in reasonable conformance with the Engineer's Estimate and a bid may be recommended for acceptance. On February 9, 2023, the Construction Contracts Award Committee met to examine and discuss the bids received as well as other pertinent information. The bid tabulations, including unit prices and extensions, of the bidders were provided to the Committee, as well as a tabulation of bid unit prices and extensions of the bids compared to the unit prices and extensions of the Engineer's Estimate. The Commission's Consultant, AECOM, also provided an evaluation of the bids received for the Project to determine the major items that varied from the Engineer's Estimate and found no apparent errors in the bid from Ruhlin. AECOM also noted that they underestimated some of the unit costs due to material availability and the effects of inflation. The Engineering staff and the Commission's consultant are recommending an award be made based upon their evaluation of the prices received. In consideration of all the information provided, the Construction Contracts Award Committee also recommends the apparent low bid for Project 43-22-06 REBID, be accepted, and awarded to The Ruhlin Company. It appears that The Ruhlin Company has the available capacity in both manpower and resources and has satisfactorily completed other Commission projects. In addition, Ruhlin has committed to meet the 10% SBE utilization goal set for the project. Therefore, it is recommended that the Commission award Contract No. 43-22-06 REBID to The Ruhlin Company in the amount of \$9,525,793.68. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of The Ruhlin Company for Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$9,525,793.68.

Chairman: Any questions or comments?

Mr. Coviello: Chief Engineer, I read somewhere about removal of netting as part of the project. Can you explain what that is?

Chief Engineer: Mr. Chairman and Commission Member Coviello, the safety netting was removed from the November project after it was looked at by our consulting firm had talked to the contractors. There wasn't a lot of large items of the existing structure that were going to be

removed over long periods time. The bid price we got back in November was around \$3 million for that item alone, so it eliminated a significant portion of the work. A lot of the removal items is going to be hand work, but it is still a very tall bridge to access to get up to the piers where they are going to remove bearings and repair some of the concrete diaphragms is where a lot of the costs comes in.

Chairman: Any other questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of The Ruhlin Company for Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$9,525,793.68* was made by Mr. Pakush, seconded by Vice Chairman Inc., and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 7-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Inc. continue.

Chief Engineer: The second resolution for your consideration seeks the Commission's authorization to award Contract No. 59-22-03 Re-Bid for the Repairs and Resurfacing of the Toll Plaza 118 interchange ramps in Erie County. This work is included in the 2023 Capital Improvement Budget. You may recall we bid this project out in May of 2022 and received one bid just under \$4.8 million, or 36% over the estimate. A resolution was adopted to reject the sole bid at the June 2022 Commission Meeting. The goal was to get a lower price and competitive bids by rebidding this winter and giving the Contractor a longer window of time to complete the work. We did not change the scope of work on the project, just the access timeframes. The job was readvertised, however, on January 6, 2023, Procurement received one (1) bid in response to this Project. The sole bid was submitted again by Gerken Paving, Inc., this time in the amount of \$4,545,544.20, which was below the revised Engineer's Estimate. Commission staff evaluated the unit bid prices and found them to be reasonable and the bid tabulation did not appear to contain any errors or anomalies. Gerken has the available capacity in both manpower and resources and has satisfactorily completed other Commission projects. In addition, Gerken has committed to exceed the 10% SBE goal as set by the Office of Equity and Inclusion. Therefore, it is recommended that the Commission award Contract No. 59-22-03 Re-Bid to Gerken Paving, Inc. in the amount of \$4,545,544.20. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution?

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of Gerken Paving, Inc. For Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$4,545,544.20.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of Gerken Paving, Inc. For Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$4,545,544.20* was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso, seconded by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 8-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Chris.

Chief Engineer: The third resolution for your consideration seeks the Commission's authorization of continuing expenditures for the Contract with Carpenter Marty for the bridge work of two bridges in Lorain County and one bridge in Cuyahoga County. Carpenter Marty previously completed design services for the project under Commission Resolution No. 36-2019. They completed final design, the construction project was advertised as Project No. 43-23-03, and subsequently awarded to the Great Lakes Construction Company by The Commission at last month's meeting. This is a Part A and Part B project wherein Part A is the Commission's work involving the bridge deck replacements and Part B is Cuyahoga County's work for the Stearns Road Reconstruction. As requested by the Engineering Department, as part of the scope of services for Project No. 71-20-02, Carpenter Marty submitted a revised fee proposal dated January 24, 2023, in the not-to-exceed amount of \$914,681.14, to perform Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services. A portion of these costs, approximately \$379,639.99, will be reimbursed by the County for the costs of inspecting the Part B work. The Engineering staff has reviewed Carpenter Marty's proposal and finds it to be reasonable for the scope to be performed. The addition of Phase II services to the Contract under Project No. 71-20-02 results in the aggregate not-to-exceed amount of \$1,225,221.14. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the Resolution?

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Please to Perform Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services Under Project No. 43-23-03 For a Total Aggregate Contract Amount of \$1,225,221.14.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Please to Perform Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services Under Project No. 43-23-03 For a Total Aggregate Contract Amount of \$1,225,221.14* was made by Mr. Pakush, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 9-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Chris.

Chief Engineer: With that our Design and Planning Engineer, Dan Rodriguez, has six resolutions for your consideration.

Design and Planning Engineer: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I have six Resolutions for the Commission's consideration this morning.

The first two resolutions for consideration seek the Commission's authorization to modify the Agreements with two bridge design firms that the Commission currently has contracts with, which are Carpenter Marty Transportation and IBI Group Engineering. The current Agreements for these firms are for Phase 1A preliminary design work and were authorized via Commission Resolutions in 2022. The preliminary design work is complete, and the Engineering Department would like to move forward with Phase 1B Services for both firms, which is for final design work and bidding services. The additional costs to obtain the necessary Phase 1B Services for these

projects will increase the cost of the contract more than the Executive Director's contracting authority, therefore requiring Commission authorization. On January 31, 2023, Carpenter Marty submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1B Services in an amount of \$245,670.00 for the design work on two bridges in Lorain County. Therefore, the Engineering Department is requesting Commission authorization to amend the Agreement for Project No. 71-22-01 with Carpenter Marty Transportation in the aggregate not-to-exceed amount of \$389,685.00. On January 17, 2023, IBI Group submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1B Services in an amount of \$349,683.00 for the final design work and bidding services on a bridge in Mahoning County. Therefore, the Engineering Department is also requesting Commission authorization to amend the Agreement for Project No. 71-22-04 with IBI Group Engineering Services in the aggregate not-to-exceed amount of \$490,877.00.

With the Chairman's permission, may the General Counsel please first read the title of the resolution authorizing Carpenter Marty?

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to Perform Phase 1B Services Under Project No. 71-22-01 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$389,685.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to Perform Phase 1B Services Under Project No. 71-22-01 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$389,685.00* was made by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 10-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Design and Planning Engineer: Thank you, and now with your permission, may the General Counsel next read the title of the Resolution authorizing IBI Group.

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. to Perform Phase 1B Services Under Project No. 71-22-04 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$490,877.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. to Perform Phase 1B Services Under Project No. 71-22-04 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$490,877.00* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 11-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Design and Planning Engineer: The next four resolutions for the Commission's consideration seek authorization to award bridge design work to consulting firms for Phase 1A services which include site and bridge inspections, surveys, and other preliminary design work. Letters of Interest for the bridge design work on these four projects were received on September 14, 2022. The LOI's were evaluated by the Engineering department and scored in accordance with the standard operating procedure, and the Office of Equity and Inclusion confirmed that all Respondent's met or exceeded the 20% SBE goal. Scoping meetings were held and fee negotiations with each of the four firms commenced.

On January 17, 2023, Civil and Environmental Consultants, Inc. submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1A Services on project 71-22-08 in the amount of \$207,010.00 for the preliminary design work on three bridges in Lorain County. The Engineering Department is requesting Commission authorization for the award of Project No. 71-22-08 to Civil and Environmental Consultants for Phase IA of this Project in the amount of \$207,010.00. With the Chairman's permission, may the General Counsel please first read the title of the resolution for Civil and Environmental Consultants, Inc.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-08 in the Total Amount of \$207,010.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments?

Vice Chairman Paradiso: Were there any other competitive bids on this project?

Design and Planning Engineer: This is not a comparative bid. It is not a change. We received LOIs which are Letters of Interest for each one of these projects and then we do a Quality Base Selection. So, on this particular one there were six firms that submitted and out of those six firms Civil and Environmental Consultants was the most highly rated.

Vice Chairman Paradiso: And again, that goes back to what we were talking about I think as Aimee was explaining some of the other contracted services. That was scored based off of a scoring card, not necessarily a bid?

Design and Planning Engineer: Yes, Sir.

Chairman: Any other questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of Civil & Environmental Consultants, Please for Project No. 71-22-08 in the Total Amount of \$207,010.00* was made by Mr. Pakush, seconded by Chairman Hruby, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 12-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Design and Planning Engineer: On February 1, 2023, Crawford, Murphy, and Tilly submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1A Services on project 71-22-09 in the amount of

\$146,936.00 for the preliminary design work on two bridges in Lorain County. The Engineering Department is requesting Commission authorization for the award of Project No. 71-22-09 to Crawford, Murphy, and Tilly for Phase IA of this Project in the amount of \$146,936.00. With the Chairman's permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution for Crawford, Murphy, and Tilly.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-09 in the Total Amount of \$146,936.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-09 in the Total Amount of \$146,936.00* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 13-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Design and Planning Engineer: On January 9, 2023, ms consultants, inc. submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1A Services on project 71-22-11 in the amount of \$173,484.00 for the preliminary design work on two bridges in Cuyahoga County. The Engineering Department is requesting Commission authorization for the award of Project No. 71-22-11 to ms consultants, inc. for Phase IA of this Project in the amount of \$173,484.00. With the Chairman's permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the Resolution for ms consultants, inc.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of ms consultants, inc. for Project No. 71-22-11 in the Total Amount of \$173,484.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of ms consultants, inc. for Project No. 71-22-11 in the Total Amount of \$173,484.00* was made by Mr. Pakush, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 14-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Design and Planning Engineer: Lastly, on February 1, 2023, American Structurepoint, Inc. submitted a fee proposal to perform Phase 1A Services on project 71-22-12 in the amount of \$133,690.00 for the preliminary design work on three bridges in Summit County. The Engineering Department is requesting Commission authorization for the award of Project No. 71-22-12 to American Structurepoint, Inc. for Phase IA of this Project in the amount of \$133,690.00. With the Chairman's permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the Resolution for American Structurepoint, Inc.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-12 in the Total Amount of \$133,690.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-12 in the Total Amount of \$133,690.00* was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso, seconded by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 15-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Anything further?

Design and Planning Engineer: Thank you and that completes my report, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members.

Chairman: We appreciate your presentation. I hope the audience realizes that we didn't just read these today. These things are distributed to us early. If it seems like we are just shot gunning these things through real quick, we are not, we took a lot of consideration in making our decision before we arrived today, so I just hope that you all understand and realize that. So, we will now move it back to you, Mr. Matta. Do you have anything further?

Chief Engineer: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Yes, we have four more resolutions that our Maintenance Operations Engineer, Bryan Emery, is going to present.

Maintenance Operations Engineer: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I have four (4) resolutions for your consideration this morning.

Three (3) resolutions for your consideration seek authorization for the purchase of various light-duty vehicles. All of these vehicles have a GVWR of less than 12,000 pounds. The purchase of such vehicles is governed by the Ohio Department of Administrative Services (ODAS) under O.R.C. Section 125.832. As a condition of these requirements, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission is required, on an annual basis, to submit to ODAS a Fleet Plan for review and acceptance. The revised 2023 Fleet Plan includes the replacement and purchase of these vehicles. The purchase of these vehicles is also included in the 2023 Capital Improvement Budget. In addition, these resolutions include the disposal of the existing vehicles in accordance with the Commission's Property Disposal Policy.

The resolution for your consideration seeks authorization for the purchase of six (6) 2023 model year Ford Explorer sport utility vehicles ("SUVs"). The best unit pricing for the six (6) 2023 model year Ford Explorer SUVs for the Commission's Administrative Staff is available under ODAS State Term Index No. GDC093, Contract No. RS1011029, Item 2AT-1. Valley Ford of Huron, of Huron, Ohio, was awarded the DAS Contract and the total price of the six (6) Ford Explorer SUVs is \$277,150.80. Four of the new SUVs will replace model years 2014 through 2020 SUVs, with mileage estimated to be over 150,000 on average when the new vehicles are placed in service. We are requesting Commission authorization for the purchase of the SUVs

from Valley Ford of Huron, of Huron, Ohio, in the total amount of \$277,150.80. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron in the Total Amount of \$277,150.80 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.

Chairman: One really quick question, in your discussion with the Ford dealership when do they think they will have these vehicles?

Maintenance Operations Engineer: Mr. Chairman and Commission Members, that is a great question. As of right now, they haven't given us an estimated timeframe for delivery, but we have a good idea that we should be receiving those vehicles, hopefully, this fiscal year.

Chairman: The reason that I ask that question and I'm sure the public understands that the procurement of vehicles today are very difficult, there's long waiting lists and we are all being told that although we are ordering these vehicles, we may not get them for some time.

Any other questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron in the Total Amount of \$277,150.80 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program* was made by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 16-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously.

Director Ahmed: Bryan, before you continue, I just want to add something to what Mr. Chairman said because we had a conversation about that. If we get into a situation where it is going to be months and months before we get these vehicles, we get to a point where we may have to go outside of the DAS contract. We will work with Aimee and Jennifer to figure out how we can do that if we get to that point because the last thing we want to do is have vehicles with too many miles and un-reliable transmissions out on the road. So, we will have to keep on that.

Mr. Coviello: Are we required to use DAS?

Chairman: No.

Director Ahmed: As the Chairman said, we are not. We usually use DAS because they do have the best prices.

Mr. Coviello: So, considering the inflation that is happening in the auto industry and with the delivery service, should we maybe experiment a period where we compare DAS to what we can negotiate directly with the dealerships?

Maintenance Operations Engineer: Mr. Chairman and Mr. Coviello, that is something that we performed during this process for the purchase of these vehicles. Obviously, being very aware of the increased prices especially this year on the State Term Contract, we did look at other dealerships along with other models and makes of SUVs, along with sedans and the other vehicles we have presented for you today and we did find that those prices are competitive and our best opportunity to actually see these vehicles.

Chairman: We've experienced this in our city. We just bought some pick-up trucks at \$146 less than what the state bid was from another dealership and they had them in stock but the problem was we couldn't get the color we wanted of course and we had to take whatever they had. Ferzan and I talked about this and if it gets to a critical state where the vehicles are just unsafe and have to be replaced, then we should do that. There are times when you can buy the vehicles cheaper than what is on the state bid. Some dealers have extras and will offer them to you that way. Please continue, Bryan.

Maintenance Operations Engineer: The next resolution for your consideration seeks authorization for the purchase of three (3) 2023 model year Ford Transit 150 Series vans. The best unit pricing for the three (3) 2023 model year Ford Transit 150 Series vans for our Technology staff is available under ODAS State Term Index No. GDC093, Contract No. RS1010870, Item 7AT-130-1. Valley Ford Truck, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, was awarded the DAS Contract and the total price for the three (3) Ford Transit 150 vans is \$170,721.00. The three new vans are for new Technology positions. We are requesting Commission authorization for the purchase of the vans from Valley Ford Truck, Inc., of Cleveland, Ohio, in the total amount of \$170,721.00. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Three (3) Cargo Vans from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$170,721.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Three (3) Cargo Vans from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$170,721.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program* was made by Chairman Hruby, seconded by Vice Chairman Paradiso, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 17-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Maintenance Operations Engineer: The next resolution for your consideration seeks authorization for the purchase of six (6) 2024 model year Chevrolet Malibu sedans. The best unit pricing for the six (6) 2024 Chevrolet Malibu sedans for the Commission's Administrative Staff is available under ODAS State Term Index No. GDC104, Contract No. RS1010229, Item 2AA-1. Valley Chevrolet, Inc., of Wellington, Ohio, was awarded the DAS Contract and the total price of the six (6) Chevrolet Malibu sedans is \$177,270.00. Five of the new sedans will replace model year 2015 through 2016 sedans, with mileage estimated to be over

119,000 on average when the new sedans are placed in service. We are requesting Commission authorization for the purchase of the sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc., of Wellington, Ohio, in the total amount of \$177,270.00. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) Malibu Midsize Sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$177,270.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) Malibu Midsize Sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$177,270.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program* was made by Mr. Pakush, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 18-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue.

Maintenance Operations Engineer: The next resolution for your consideration seeks the Commission's authorization to award Bid Invitation No. 4424 for the furnishing of approximately 550,000 pounds of hot-pour, ready mixed joint sealant material. On January 9, 2023, Procurement received three (3) bids for this material under Bid Invitation No. 4424. The apparent low bid was submitted by Crafc0, Inc. ("Crafc0"), of Chandler, Arizona, at a unit price of \$0.4960 per pound. Crafc0 proposes to furnish the joint sealant material and services in accordance with the Specifications. Crafc0 has furnished similar material to the Commission in the past and has performed satisfactorily. Additionally, Crafc0 has a significant Ohio presence as this product is manufactured in Youngstown, Ohio. Therefore, I am recommending that an award be made to Crafc0, Inc., of Chandler, Arizona, in the amount of \$286,440.00, which includes the five percent delivery variance required by the Bid Invitation. With your permission, may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Authorizing the Selection of Crafc0, Inc. for Joint Sealant Under Bid Invitation No. 4424 in the Total Amount of \$286,440.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Authorizing the Selection of Crafc0, Inc. for Joint Sealant Under Bid Invitation No. 4424 in the Total Amount of \$286,440.00* was made by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, seconded by Mr. Pakush, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 19-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Are you done?

Maintenance Operations Engineer: Yes, that's it.

Chairman: Very good. Welcome again and you did a great job in you first chance up here.

Maintenance Operations Engineer: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members.

Chairman: Are you done, Chris?

Chief Engineer: Mr. Chairman and Commission Members, I am done.

Chairman: Well, you had a lot of good support.

Chief Engineer: Yes, Dan oversees our Engineering Staff and Bryan, obviously, oversees the Maintenance staff, so they are well versed in all the stuff we are trying to procure.

Chairman: We will now move on to the Western District Toll Plaza Supervisor, Jayne Ferreira.

Western District Toll Plaza Supervisor: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I have two resolutions for your consideration this morning.

The first resolution for your consideration seeks authorization to award Contract #4422 for the furnishing of all services and material for the cleaning of the Commission's Group I Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 89 for the remainder of this year, with the option to review for two possible one-year renewal terms.

This invitation was for the following:

- Group I Toll Plazas 2 through 91 and the Swanton OSP Post 89

The following company submitted the lowest responsive bid for Group I:

- Any Domestic Work, I
Monthly Fee of \$9,200.00
With an estimated total amount of \$312,800.00

Any Domestic Work is currently providing services to the Group I facilities under an extension of their previous contract. Their performance thus far has been satisfactory.

With your permission may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4422 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 89 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$312,800.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4422 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 89 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$312,800.00* was made by Vice Chairman Paradiso, seconded by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 20-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Please continue, Jayne.

Western District Toll Plaza Supervisor: The second resolution for your consideration seeks authorization to award Contract #4428 for the furnishing of all services and material for the cleaning of the Commission's Group III Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 91 for the remainder of this year, with the option to review for two possible one-year renewal terms.

This invitation was for the following:

- Group III Toll Plazas 180 through 239 and the Hiram OSP Post 91

The following company submitted the lowest responsive bid for Group III;

- Any Domestic Work, I
Monthly Fee of \$8,420.00
With an estimated total amount of \$286,280.00.

Any Domestic Work is currently providing services to the Group I facilities and their performance thus far has been satisfactory.

With your permission may the General Counsel please read the title of the resolution.

General Counsel: Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4428 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 91 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$286,280.00.

Chairman: Any questions or comments? Hearing none, please call the roll.

MOTION: A motion to adopt a *Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4428 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 91 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$286,280.00* was made by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and approved by all Commission Members present. Resolution No. 21-2023.

Chairman: The resolution passes unanimously. Anything further, Jayne?

Western District Toll Plaza Supervisor: That completes my report, Mr. Chairman.

Chairman: Thank you very much for your report. We appreciate it very much. We will now move on to the report of our Chief Financial Officer, Lisa Mejac.

Chief Financial Officer: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have a brief update on our traffic and revenue for the month of January this morning.

This first chart shows the monthly passenger car miles traveled on the Ohio Turnpike over the past two years. Passenger car vehicle miles traveled were up 10.9% from January of last year. There was one less weekend day in 2023 than in 2022.

This next chart shows the monthly passenger car toll revenue over the past two years. The increase in passenger car traffic combined with the toll rate increases caused passenger car toll revenues to increase by approximately 11.0% from January of last year.

This chart shows the monthly commercial miles traveled on the Ohio Turnpike over the past two years. Commercial miles traveled were up 1.8% from January of last year. There was one more weekday in 2023 than in 2022.

Next, this chart shows the monthly commercial toll revenue over the past two years. The increase in commercial traffic combined with the toll rate increases caused commercial toll revenues to increase 3.8% from January of last year. This chart shows year-to-date toll revenues through the month of January during each year over the past decade. Year-to-date total toll revenues were approximately \$1.4 million or 5.9% above the amount from last year.

That completes my report, Mr. Chairman.

Chairman: Any questions?

Vice Chairman: Lisa, can I ask a question and I do not know that you are prepared to answer it, but do we think that any of the east/west traffic is looking for alternative routes, it might be an ODOT question, with the increases of our tolls? Are we losing some miles because of the toll increase to other east/west routes? Do we have any insight on that?

Chief Financial Officer: Mr. Chairman and Vice Chairman Paradiso, we haven't done a full in depth analysis on that. We haven't seen any trends like that. We would look at our traffic density reports to further do that.

Vice Chairman: I am comfortable that our rates are well inline and below the median and I feel good about how our rate action is working and the competitive data we have for that, but I am just curious as a consumer if the commercial drivers are choosing alternative route. I do not know why I asked that, but I guess ODOT would be interested in that as well.

Mr. Pakush: Mr. Chairman, I haven't seen any data on diversion off of the Turnpike. But, I know in the past, a long time ago, maybe twenty years ago, there was a study on diversion, but I haven't seen a report or anything recently on diversion. I have not heard of anything through my meetings of any issues on the state system as a result of diversion.

Director Ahmed: Mr. Vice Chairman, we do think about that. I am going to just make a guess here. I don't think that we are seeing any diversions because the average increase to a consumer is not that high. For the commercial trucks coming from New York to Chicago this is still the best option. For the average person driving a passenger vehicle across the Turnpike, those average rate increases thanks to the oversight of the Commission have been very modest. Related to your question, in some other states the rate increases have been fairly steep because they have used their turnpike to fund gaps in other programs. In some states, turnpikes have been used to fund transit gaps. I guess you can do whatever you want to do, but there's always a consequence of that. I just wanted to throw that out there.

Secretary-Treasurer: I was just going to comment, I drive from Milepost 34 to here and if there's any kind of graph that you would use, I see a lot of semi-trucks on the Turnpike from here and I am sure it's going beyond. I even thought to myself that commercial traffic is really up.

Mr. Coviello: That is a good question. I mean rate wise, yes. The neighboring states are much higher *inaudible*...coming out of the states they are entering a non-toll *inaudible*...better job of taking care of the freeways *inaudible*...other things to consider.

Director Ahmed: Mr. Chairman and Mr. Coviello, that is true those are definitely things to consider. Director Marchbanks had put together a group that included myself, the Pennsylvania DOT, the Pennsylvania Turnpike, the Indiana DOT and the Kentucky DOT, in anticipation of the opening of the Gordie Howe Bridge, that's the new several billion dollar bridge between Detroit and Windsor and projections are that it will increase north/south truck traffic on I-75 and east/west which is us and in anticipation of that, some of the conversations we've been having is it is time for us to look at the four lane section with the two lanes in each direction outside of the main Turnpike and start preparing for making that three lanes as well in anticipation of that truck traffic. The other consideration with the projected increase in truck traffic is parking at service plazas. That is going to become quite an issue. I think that is going to be a nationwide issue. It has been discussed at IBTTA meetings and I believe Mr. Pakush can verify that probably and at the AASHTO level as well.

Mr. Coviello: *inaudible*...traffic from the Gordie Howe Bridge entering Ohio *inaudible*...

Director Ahmed: I am anticipating them to use the Ohio Turnpike, yes. The east/west traffic will be primarily on the Ohio Turnpike and the north/south will be on I-75 according to the projections.

Mr. Coviello: *inaudible*...

Director Ahmed: So, of our 241-miles about 80 miles are still four lane. The first forty miles coming in from Pennsylvania and forty miles coming in from Indiana. Other than just the volume of traffic the other impact that we see from that section is that when we get into a construction project, we are down to one lane and this is a superhighway. For a superhighway to

be down to one lane is dangerous. If there is a crash then everything is shut down. So, I believe, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members it is time for us to look at that as a future three lane section.

Mr. Coviello: Is Gordie Howe open?

Director Ahmed: I believe Gordie Howe is going to open at the end of 2024. Some of us are going to take a tour of it. The original tour was arranged by Director Marchbanks and we were not able to make it, but I've spoken to the people who are running the project over at Gordie Howe. If they are going to send traffic our way, we are curious to see what that bridge is all about. There's a lot of conversation about that bridge.

Chairman: Very good. Anything further, Lisa?

Chief Financial Officer: That completes my report, Mr. Chairman.

Chairman: Thank you. We will move on to the report of the General Counsel, Jennifer Rieker.

General Counsel: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Members of the Commission.

I wanted to provide a report on the recent public hearings. Following the January Commission Meeting, we held its first public hearing here in the Commission Room to discuss the proposed toll rate changes and changes to the Ohio Administrative Code. Chairman Hruby served as the Public Hearing officer.

The second public hearing was scheduled for January 25, 2023, in Maumee, Ohio. However, we did cancel and reschedule that meeting due to inclement weather. On February 9, 2023, OTIC held the rescheduled second meeting in Maumee, Ohio. Mrs. Barber served as the Public Hearing officer. We had one individual attend this public hearing. However, he declined to make any public comments. Instead, he did want to learn what his toll rate would increase to following the toll rate changes.

The third public hearing occurred on February 1, 2023, in Boardman, Ohio. Mr. Coviello served as the Public Hearing officer. At that meeting, we had about ten individuals in attendance all from a group known as A.B.A.T.E, which stands for American Bikers Aimed Toward Education. Their State Legislative Director, William Dodge spoke and requested that the Turnpike consider reduced motorcycle fares.

As to the next steps following this public hearing, we will be bringing a resolution to implement toll schedule in the coming months.

Additionally, as to the changes in the Administrative Code Rules I will be sending those proposed changes to the Common Sense Initiative within the next month. Following that, the Common Sense Initiative will then refer those proposed changes to the Legislative Service

Commission and I will be reporting back to the Commission as to any of the actions taken from that.

With that, that concludes my report.

Chairman: Thank you. Any questions for the General Counsel? Hearing none, let's move on to the report of the Ohio State Highway Patrol, Staff Lieutenant Richard Reeder.

Staff Lieutenant Reeder: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Commission Members. I will try to be brief today.

Unfortunately, I will report on a fatal traffic crash we handled on January 7, 2023, at 7:37 p.m., Troopers were dispatched to the westbound lanes of IR-80 Ohio Turnpike at milepost 166.2 for a report of a one-vehicle crash that had struck the median concrete barrier. The preliminary investigation revealed that a silver 2000 Dodge 4x4 pick-up had been traveling westbound before it went off the left side of the roadway and struck the concrete barrier. Airbags were deployed from the vehicle. The driver of the Dodge pick-up a 75-year male of Port Clinton, Ohio, was provided CPR, and an AED was also utilized on scene by the responding Trooper. The driver was transported from the scene to Southwest General hospital for treatment. He was pronounced deceased at the hospital as a result of the injuries sustained in the crash. The driver was not wearing a seatbelt at the time of the crash.

Unfortunately, we had a double fatality yesterday that I will report on next month. That crash, as well, the two occupants were not wearing their seatbelts. The structural portion of the minivan they were driving was intact. They rolled over, but very sad and very preventable just by taking those few seconds to put on a seatbelt. So, that will be something I will work with the commanders here and we will try, not that we don't, look for seatbelt enforcement, but maybe we will do some educational efforts as well as enforcement and ticket.

On Monday, January 30, 2023 at 1228 hours, Trooper Boyer D-3 Criminal Patrol, stopped a rented 2021 Mazda CX-5 on the Ohio Turnpike near Milepost 174 for a marked lanes violation. Plain smell burnt marijuana was detected upon approach to the vehicle. A probable cause search was conducted, revealing 2.2 pounds of crystal methamphetamine, which had been dumped on the back seat floor and covered with soft drinks. Both occupants were removed from the vehicle and secured. The female driver, from Oilfield, Pennsylvania, and the male passenger, from Detroit, Michigan were read their Miranda Rights and informed of our findings. The male passenger immediately complained of shortness of breath and chest pains, and a squad was called to the scene. While awaiting the squad, Cleveland Dispatch Center advised of a felony warrant for the male out of Pennsylvania. Richfield Fire and EMS arrived on scene and subsequently medically cleared the passenger. The female driver was released from the scene pending F1 Trafficking in Meth. The passenger was transported to Summit County Jail and incarcerated. After a positive test for methamphetamine (Summit County Drug Unit assisted with testing), contact was made with the Summit County Prosecutor who advised to charge the suspect while he is in our custody. Charges were filed at Summit County for F-1 Trafficking in methamphetamine.

I want to end on a good note here, on January 31, 2023, at approximately 1:00 a.m., Trooper Sheridan with the Pennsylvania State Police contacted Cleveland Dispatch to advise of a missing person out of Pennsylvania. Her cell phone was being pinged on the Ohio Turnpike near North Ridgeville. Trooper Sheridan advised that the missing 19-year old female had the mental capacity of a 12-15 year old liked to meet people online and sneak off. Trooper Andre Thomas and Trooper Alex Schlottag, of the Milan Post, were dispatched to look for her vehicle, a gold GMC Terrain with PA registration LRY8277. Trooper Thomas located the vehicle at mile marker 153.8 westbound on the Ohio Turnpike and Trooper Cindy Wilt, of the Milan Post, was also enroute to this location. Trooper Sheridan was advised that OSHP was in contact with the missing female. He stated that her parents wanted to drive to pick her up but it would take nearly five hours to do so. A relay was set up with units from the Hiram Post to relay the female to the PA/OH line. With the help of Trooper Spenser Geib and Trooper Ricky Caraway, of the Hiram Post, the missing female was safely relayed to the Pennsylvania State Police.

Lastly, I will make a quick note, I've been doing this administrative position for about a year and half now and I don't get a chance to work the road as much as I would like to. Yesterday, I had the opportunity to go out and work the road. It was a beautiful day, it kind of took me to my days when I was a Trooper and I did end up going over to that fatal crash and it just amazes me how efficient our Troopers are. Again, yesterday they did lifesaving measures to these two victims, but by the time I got there everything was handled, the scene was secure, the fire department was on scene, the field sketch was started, the pictures were taken, they had already contacted the duty officers for District 1. It just makes you proud to know how efficient and everything these Troopers do every day to make this road safe and I just wanted to say that. Thank you to them. Any questions?

Chairman: We do appreciate your leadership, Lieutenant. You do a great job. We appreciate your work.

The next meeting of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission will be held on Monday, March 20, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. here at the Commission's Administration Building located in Berea, Ohio.

If there is no further business, I will accept a motion to adjourn the 705th Commission Meeting.

MOTION: A motion to adjourn the 705th Commission Meeting is made by Secretary-Treasurer Barber, seconded by Mr. Coviello, and unanimously approved by all Commission Members present.

Time of adjournment: 11:25 a.m.

Attendees for Record Keeping Purposes:

Commission Members: Chairman Jerry Hruby; Vice Chairman Timothy Paradiso; Secretary-Treasurer Sandra Barber; Commission Member Guy Coviello; Commission Member Myron Pakush; and Office of Budget and Management Representative Michael Babin.

Other Attendees: Ben Near, Ruhlin; Ed Adamczyk, Arcadis; Tony Uranker, ms consultants; Hamid Homae, TBD Advisors; Todd Majidzadeh, Resource International; Jon Lorincz, AECOM; Art Rometo, GAI Consultants; Bob Parker, CEC; ; Maureen Shildwachter, Huntington; and Ismael Gutierrez, Jr., IUOE #18

Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission and Ohio State Highway Patrol Personnel: Ferzan M. Ahmed, P.E., Ohio Turnpike; Staff Lieutenant Richard Reeder, Ohio State Highway Patrol; Lieutenant Brett Gockstetter, Ohio State Highway Patrol; Jennifer Monty Rieker, Ohio Turnpike; Heather Veljkovic, Ohio Turnpike; Chris Matta, Ohio Turnpike; Aimee Lane, Ohio Turnpike; Sue Coleman, Ohio Turnpike; Lisa Mejac, Ohio Turnpike; Matt Cole, Ohio Turnpike; Chriss Pogorelc, Ohio Turnpike; Chuck Cyrill, Ohio Turnpike; Lwin Muang, Ohio Turnpike; Zach Haderski, Ohio Turnpike; Jackie Dohoda Herberger, Ohio Turnpike; Lisa Drozdowski, Ohio Turnpike; Bryan Emery, Ohio Turnpike; Kevin Golick, Ohio Turnpike; Daniel Rodriguez, Ohio Turnpike; Joseph Gardner, Ohio Turnpike; Jayne Ferreira, Ohio Turnpike; Sydney Sallee, Cleveland Marshall College of Law/Ohio Turnpike Extern; Heather Mihalick, Ohio Turnpike; Kristin Obermeyer, Ohio Turnpike; Jennifer Diaz, Ohio Turnpike; David Miller, Ohio Turnpike; Chuck Cyrill, Ohio Turnpike; and Adam Greenslade, Ohio Turnpike.

EXHIBITS

- Resolution No. 7-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of The Ruhlin Company for Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$9,525,793.68.
- Resolution No. 8-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of Gerken Paving, Inc. For Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$4,545,544.20.
- Resolution No. 9-2023 – Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to Perform Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services Under Project No. 43-23-03 For a Total Aggregate Contract Amount of \$1,225,221.14.
- Resolution No. 10-2023 – Resolution Authorizing Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation to Perform Phase IB Services Under Project No. 71-22-01 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$389,685.00.
- Resolution No. 11-2023 – Resolution Authorizing Modification to the Contract with IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. to Perform Phase IB Services Under Project No. 71-22-04 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$490,877.00.
- Resolution No. 12-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-08 in the Total Amount of \$207,010.00
- Resolution No. 13-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-09 in the Total Amount of \$146,936.00.
- Resolution No. 14-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of ms consultants, inc. for Project No. 71-22-11 in the Total Amount of \$173,484.00.
- Resolution No. 15-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-12 in the Total Amount of \$133,690.00.
- Resolution No. 16-2023 – Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron in the Total Amount of \$277,150.80 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.
- Resolution No. 17-2023 – Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Three (3) Cargo Vans from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$170,721.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.

- Resolution No. 18-2023 – Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) Malibu Midsize Sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$177,270.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program.
- Resolution No. 19-2023 – Resolution Authorizing the Selection of Crafc0, Inc. for Joint Sealant Under Bid Invitation No. 4424 in the Total Amount of \$286,440.00.
- Resolution No. 20-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4422 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 89 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$312,800.00.
- Resolution No. 21-2023 – Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4428 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 91 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$286,280.00.

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of The Ruhlin Company for Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$9,525,793.68

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) published a notice in accordance with law to advertise an invitation to bid on a contract for the Bridge Repair and Rehabilitation on the Ohio Turnpike over the Cuyahoga River at Milepost 176.9 in Summit County, Ohio, and designated as Project No. 43-22-06; and

WHEREAS, the Commission received one (1) bid on Project No. 43-22-06 and because the bid was in excess of 100% above the Engineer’s Estimate, pursuant to Resolution No. 82-2022, adopted November 21, 2022, the Commission rejected the bid; and

WHEREAS, the Commission published a notice in accordance with law readvertising its invitation to bid upon a contract for Bridge Repair and Rehabilitation on the Ohio Turnpike over the Cuyahoga River at Milepost 176.9 in Summit County, Ohio, and now designated as Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) (hereinafter the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, the Commission received two (2) bids to perform the Contractor’s obligations on the Project, as follows:

	The Ruhlin Company (“Ruhlin”)	Suburban Maintenance & Construction, Inc.
Total	\$9,525,793.68	\$9,656,425.00

WHEREAS, both bids were in excess of ten percent (10%) above the Engineer’s estimate and, pursuant to Article V of the Instructions to Bidders, the Commission convened the

Construction Contracts Award Committee (“CCAC”) to determine if the bid prices are within reasonable conformance with the Engineer’s estimate and a bid price may be accepted by the Commission upon a recommendation by the Committee; and

WHEREAS, the CCAC met on February 9, 2023, and after considering the Commission consultant’s evaluation memorandum and information provided by the Commission’s Engineering staff, the CCAC determined that the apparent low bid submitted by Ruhlin, of Sharon Center, Ohio, should be accepted for the reasons set forth in the CCAC memorandum dated February 10, 2023, which is before the Commission and summarized below:

- The Project was advertised on January 4, 2023, and the Commission received two (2) bids; re-advertising the Project is not likely to attract more bidders and would negatively impact the schedule, likely extending the bridge work from a one-year project to a two-year project;
- There is only a 1.4% difference between the bidders submitted pricing, which represents competitive and consistent pricing;
- A delay in awarding the Project would negatively impact completion time due to significant lead times for fabricated steel components (bearings) and increase costs to ensure timely completion (i.e., accelerated construction costs in 2023 and/or increased cost for any 2024 work);
- The largest disparities were in the General and Structures Categories:
 - General Section – Ruhlin’s bid was \$1,208,000.00 less than the engineer’s estimate.
 - Portions of Structure Removed – The Engineer’s Estimate was \$25,000 and Ruhlin’s bid was \$4,800,000. This was a lump sum item and additional cost for other unit price items, specifically site access, was applied to this lump sum item.
 - Ruhlin’s bid pricing for other structural items (replacing expansion bearing devices, jacking and temporary support of superstructure, patching, concrete weatherproofing and continuous strip seal) was approximately \$2.3 million less than the engineer’s estimate.
 - The Project includes various means and methods for the difficult access and handling of materials on this high-level structure and the bid amounts for several items were underestimated by the Commission’s consultant.
- Pricing and availability of construction labor and materials is not expected to decrease in the foreseeable future;
- There are no scope items that could be removed to still accomplish the intent and the requirements of the Project;
- Awarding the Project to the low bidder, Ruhlin, will not adversely affect the Commission’s Capital Program or financial condition;
- Ruhlin has committed to meet the SBE goal for the Project;
- Ruhlin’s bid appears balanced; and
- Ruhlin appears to have capacity to perform the Project.

WHEREAS, the CCAC reports that Ruhlin submitted the apparent low bid on the Project in the total bid amount of \$9,525,793.68 which it recommends the Commission accept and approve authorization for the Executive Director to award; and

WHEREAS, the Director of Contracts Administration determined that bids for the Project were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions and the same specifications, that selecting the bid of Ruhlin conforms to the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.54, 5537.07 and 9.312, and Ruhlin submitted a performance bond with good and sufficient surety; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion has found that Ruhlin has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 10% which meets the SBE participation goal of 10% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary to approve the Contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Bylaws because the amount of the bids received will require expenditures under the Project that will exceed \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, the CCAC recommends the Commission select Ruhlin as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Commission's Director of Administration concurs with the CCAC's recommendation that the Commission approve the award of the Project to Ruhlin as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of The Ruhlin Company for Project No. 43-22-06 (REBID) in the amount of \$9,525,793.68 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Chief Engineer is authorized to execute a contract based on said bid.

(Resolution No. 7-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of Gerken Paving, Inc. **For Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) for the Total Amount of \$4,545,544.20**

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) published a notice in accordance with law to advertise an Invitation to Bid on a contract for Repairs and Resurfacing at the Interchange 118 Ramps at Milepost 118.60 in Erie County, Ohio, and designated as Project No. 59-22-03; and

WHEREAS, the Commission received one (1) bid on Project No. 59-22-03 and because the sole bid was 36.4% above the Engineer’s Estimate, pursuant to Resolution No. 47-2022, adopted June 21, 2022, the Commission rejected the bid; and

WHEREAS, the Commission published notice in accordance with law readvertising its invitation to bid upon a contract for Repairs and Resurfacing at the Interchange 118 Ramps at Milepost 118.60 in Erie County, Ohio, designated as Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) (hereinafter the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, on January 6, 2023, the Commission received one (1) bid to perform the Contractor’s obligations on the Project and the report of the Commission’s Chief Engineer concerning the review and analysis of the bids is before the Commission; and

WHEREAS, the Chief Engineer reports that Gerken Paving, Inc. (“Gerken”), of Napoleon, Ohio, submitted the apparent low bid on the Project in the total bid amount of \$4,545,544.20, which he recommends the Commission accept and approve authorization for the Executive Director to award; and

WHEREAS, the Director of Contracts Administration has determined that bids for the Project were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions and the same specifications, that selecting the bid of Gerken conforms to the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.54, 5537.07 and 9.312, and Gerken submitted a performance bond with good and sufficient surety; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion has found that Gerken has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 10.38% which exceeds the SBE participation goal of 10% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary to approve the Contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Bylaws because the amount of the bid received will require expenditures under the Project that will exceed \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, the Chief Engineer recommends the Commission select Gerken as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Commission's Executive Director concurs with the Chief Engineer's recommendation that the Commission approve the award the Project to Gerken as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of Gerken Paving, Inc. for Project No. 59-22-03 (REBID) in the amount of \$4,545,544.20 is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received and the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract based on said bid.

(Resolution No. 8-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to Perform Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services Under Project No. 43-23-03 For a Total Aggregate Contract Amount of \$1,225,221.14

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) selected Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. (“Carpenter Marty”) to perform professional engineering services for Part A – Bridge Deck Replacement and Rehabilitation on the Ohio Turnpike over SR 57 at Milepost 145.1, Race Road over the Ohio Turnpike at Milepost 149.2, and Stearns Road over the Ohio Turnpike at Milepost 154.6 in Lorain and Cuyahoga Counties, Ohio, and Part B – Stearns Road (C.R. 76) Reconstruction in the Township of Olmsted, in Cuyahoga County, Ohio (“Project 71-20-02”) pursuant to the Resolution No 58-2020 and for the scope of work identified below:

CONTRACT ITERATION	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	RESOLUTION NO.	NOT TO EXCEED AMOUNT
Original Contract	Phase I Services – Site Inspection, Engineering Report, Design and Plan Preparation Services	August 2, 2020	58-2020	\$310,360.00
First Modification	Extension of Completion Date of Phase I Services	N/A	Executive Director	N/A
TOTAL CONTRACT VALUE:				\$310,360.00

CONTRACT ITERATION	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	RESOLUTION NO.	NOT TO EXCEED AMOUNT
<i>Second Modification</i>	<i>Phase II Services - Construction Administration and Inspection for Project No. 43-23-03</i>	<i>January 24, 2023</i>	<i>proposed</i>	<i>\$914,861.14</i>
TOTAL CONTRACT VALUE (incl. Second Modification):				\$1,225,221.14

WHEREAS, the Commission selected a contractor to make the public improvements that Carpenter Marty designed as part of its Phase I Services, and Carpenter Marty submitted a fee proposal dated January 24, 2023, in the not-to-exceed amount of \$914,861.14, (of which Cuyahoga County will contribute \$379,639.99) to perform the necessary Phase II Construction Administration and Inspection Services (“Phase II Services) for Construction Project No. 43-23-03, which the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and appropriate; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the Chief Engineer’s recommendation and concurs that the Commission should approve and authorize obtaining the Phase II Services from Carpenter Marty as described in the fee proposal dated January 24, 2023, as the services are in furtherance of and are necessary for implementing the bridge and roadway work required under Project No. 43-23-03; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary to approve the modification to the Contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Bylaws because the amount described in the fee proposal from Carpenter Marty, dated January 24, 2023, for the Phase II Services will increase the Contract by an amount that exceeds the greater of \$150,000.00 or 10% of the original contract amount; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the fee proposal from Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. dated January 24, 2023, to perform the required Phase II Services under Project No. 43-23-03, for the not-to-exceed amount of \$914,861.14 is accepted and approved, for a total maximum contract amount of \$1,225,221.14; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Executive Director is authorized to amend the contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to incorporate the fee proposal dated January 24, 2023, and increase the total not-to-exceed amount payable under the contract to \$1,225,221.14 in accordance with the terms and conditions of the existing contract and Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc.'s technical responses and accepted fee proposals to perform the professional engineering services identified therein in furtherance of Project No. 43-23-03.

(Resolution No. 9-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. to Perform Phase IB Services Under Project No. 71-22-01 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$389,685.00

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) selected Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. (“Carpenter Marty”) to perform engineering design services and engineering support during construction for the Bridge Deck Replacement and Bridge Deck Rehabilitation on the Ohio Turnpike over Lorain Road at Milepost 152.3 and Bagley Road over the Ohio Turnpike at Milepost 152.9 in Lorain County, Ohio designated as Project 71-22-01 (the “Project”), pursuant to the Resolution No 57-2020 and for the scope of work identified below:

SERVICES/FEEES APPROVED TO DATE

CONTRACT	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	APPROVAL	AMOUNT
Original Contract	Phase IA Services – Project No. 71-22-01 – architectural/engineering design services, specifically site inspection, engineering report, and survey.	August 4, 2022	Resolution 57-2022	\$144,015.00
First Modification	Contract modification to permit mileage reimbursements	N/A	Executive Director	N/A

TOTAL AMOUNT TO DATE: \$144,015.00

PROPOSED SERVICES/FEEES

CONTRACT	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	APPROVAL	AMOUNT
<i>Second Modification</i>	Phase IB Services - Project No. 71-22-01 - preliminary and final design plans, and assistance during the bidding process, including bid review services	January 31, 2023 (Revised)	<i>Proposed</i>	\$245,670.00

TOTAL AMOUNT WITH MODIFICATION: \$389,685.00

WHEREAS, the parties entered into a Contract for Professional Engineering Services (the “Contract”), dated September 1, 2022; and

WHEREAS, the parties contemplated modifying the Contract after the completion of the Phase IA Services to incorporate additional design services based on the findings of the work performed under Phase IA and to be separately designated as Phase IB; and

WHEREAS, the Phase IA Services are complete, and the parties prepared a final design scope for the Project which includes, but is not limited to, preliminary and final design and plans, and assistance during the bidding process, including bid review services (“Phase IB Services”); and

WHEREAS, Carpenter Marty submitted a fee proposal dated January 31, 2023, in the not-to-exceed amount of \$245,670.00, to perform the Phase IB Services which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and necessary; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation submitted by the Chief Engineer and approves the recommendation to authorize Carpenter Marty to perform the Phase IB Design Services under Project No. 71-22-01; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the proposed Contract modification exceeds the greater of \$150,000 or 10% of the original contract amount; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the revised proposal from Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc. dated January 31, 2023 to perform the Phase IB Services, specifically described in the recitals, under Project No. 71-22-01 in the not-to-exceed amount of \$245,670.00 is accepted and approved, and the Executive Director is authorized to amend the Contract with Carpenter Marty Transportation, Inc., to perform such additional services in accordance with the terms and conditions of the existing Contract and Carpenter Marty Transportation Inc.’s revised fee proposal dated January 31, 2023, in the aggregate not-to-exceed amount of \$389,685.00.

(Resolution No. 10-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing a Modification to the Contract with IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. to Perform Phase IB Services Under Project No. 71-22-04 for an Aggregate Not-to-Exceed Amount of \$490,877.00

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) selected IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. (“IBI”), to perform engineering design services and engineering support during construction for the Bridge Replacement at US Route 224 over the Ohio Turnpike at Milepost 227.6 in Mahoning County, Ohio, designated as Project 71-22-04 (the “Project”), pursuant to the Resolution No 43-2022 and for the scope of work identified below:

SERVICES/FEES APPROVED TO DATE

CONTRACT	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	APPROVAL	AMOUNT
Original Contract	Phase IA Services – Project No. 71-22-04 – architectural/engineering design services, specifically site inspection, engineering report, and survey.	June 10, 2022 (Revised)	Resolution 43-2022	\$141,194.00
First Modification	N/A - contract modification to permit mileage reimbursements	N/A	Executive Director	N/A

TOTAL AMOUNT TO DATE: \$141,194.00

PROPOSED SERVICES/FEES

CONTRACT	SERVICES	FEE PROPOSAL	APPROVAL	AMOUNT
<i>Second Modification</i>	Phase IB Services - Project No. 71-22-04 - preliminary and final design and plans, and assistance during the bidding process, including bid review services	January 17, 2023 (Revised)	<i>Proposed</i>	\$349,683.00

TOTAL AMOUNT WITH MODIFICATION: \$490,877.00

WHEREAS, the parties entered into a Contract for Professional Engineering Services (the “Contract”), dated June 30, 2022; and

WHEREAS, the parties contemplated modifying the Contract after the completion of the Phase IA Services to incorporate additional design services based on the findings of the work performed under Phase IA and to be separately designated as Phase IB; and

WHEREAS, the Phase IA Services are complete, and the parties prepared a final design scope for the Project which includes, but is not limited to, preliminary and final design and plans,

and assistance during the bidding process, including bid review services (“Phase IB Services”); and

WHEREAS, IBI submitted a revised fee proposal dated January 17, 2023, in the not-to-exceed amount of \$349,683.00, to perform the Phase IB Services which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and necessary; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation submitted by the Chief Engineer and approves the recommendation to authorize IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. to perform the Phase IB Design Services under Project No. 71-22-04; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the proposed Contract modification exceeds the greater of \$150,000 or 10% of the original contract amount; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the revised proposal from IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc. dated January 17, 2023 to perform the Phase IB Services, specifically described in the recitals, under Project No. 71-22-04 in the not-to-exceed amount of \$349,683.00 is accepted and approved, and the Executive Director is authorized to amend the Contract with IBI Group Engineering Services (USA), Inc., to perform such additional services in accordance with the terms and conditions of the existing Contract and IBI’s revised fee proposal dated January 17, 2023, in the aggregate not-to-exceed amount of \$490,877.00.

(Resolution No. 11-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-08 in the Total Amount of \$207,010.00

WHEREAS, on August 24, 2022, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) issued Request for Letters of Interest No. 11-2022 seeking letters of interest for design services and engineering support during construction for Project No. 71-22-08, Deck Replacement of the Gore-Orphanage Road Bridge (County Route 34) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 133.1, Deck Replacement of the Vermilion Road Bridge (County Route 70) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 135.0, and Deck Replacement of the Ohio Turnpike Mainline Bridge over Baumhart Road (County Route 51) at Milepost 136.2, all in Lorain County, Ohio (the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, on September 14, 2022, Letters of Interest were received from six (6) firms expressing their readiness to serve as the Commission’s engineering consultant for Project No. 71-22-08; and

WHEREAS, on the basis of the proposals received, in accordance with the Commission’s Standard Operating Procedure for Professional Design Consultant Selection Process, the Engineering staff concluded that Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. (“CEC”), is the most qualified firm to perform the necessary services for the Project and conducted a Scope of Services meeting to confirm a mutual understanding of the Phase IA Services for the Project consisting of bridge inspection, structure analysis, field survey, base mapping, maintenance of traffic evaluation, utility location, stakeholder outreach/ODOT coordination, load rating, and engineering report (“Phase IA Services”); and

WHEREAS, CEC submitted its revised fee proposal dated February 1, 2023, to perform the Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$207,010.00 which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and appropriate, and recommends that the Commission approve the award of the contract to CEC based on its technical proposal for Project No. 71-22-08; and

WHEREAS, the Commission’s Director of Contracts Administration has determined that the LOI process and the selection of CEC conforms with the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 to 153.71, that all legal requirements were performed and that the proposals were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions with respect to all respondents and potential respondents; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion determined that CEC has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 20% which meets the SBE participation goal of 20% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation of the Chief Engineer and concurs that the Commission should approve the selection of CEC to perform the Phase IA Services for Project No. 71-22-08; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary to approve the contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Bylaws because CEC's fee proposal to perform the Phase IA Services exceeds \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution seeks authorization of Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$207,010.00 but the contract includes additional Phase I Services and Phase II Services, and Commission staff will modify the contract in accordance with the Commission's contracts policy to include those additional services at the time they are necessary for successful completion of the Project, including presenting a resolution to the Commission if required; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the selection of Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. is approved as the most qualified firm to perform the design services and engineering support during construction necessary for Project No. 71-22-08, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract with Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc. for Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$207,010.00.

(Resolution No. 12-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-09 in the Total Amount of \$146,936.00

WHEREAS, on August 24, 2022, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) issued Request for Letters of Interest No. 12-2022 seeking letters of interest for design services and engineering support during construction for Project No. 71-22-09, Deck Replacement of the Pyle South Amherst Road Bridge (County Route 16) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 138.7 and Deck Replacement of the West Ridge Road Bridge (County Route 53) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 142.0 both in Lorain County, Ohio (“Project No. 71-22-09”); and

WHEREAS, on September 14, 2022, Letters of Interest were received from seven (7) firms expressing their readiness to serve as the Commission’s engineering consultant for Project No. 71-22-09; and

WHEREAS, on the basis of the proposals received, in accordance with the Commission’s Standard Operating Procedure for Professional Design Consultant Selection Process, the Engineering staff concluded that Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. (“CMT”), is the most qualified firm to perform the necessary services for the Project and conducted a Scope of Services meeting to confirm a mutual understanding of the Phase IA Services for the Project consisting of bridge inspection, field survey, base mapping, maintenance of traffic evaluation, utility location, stakeholder outreach/ODOT coordination, load rating, and engineering report (“Phase IA Services”); and

WHEREAS, CMT submitted its revised fee proposal dated February 1, 2023, to perform the Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$146,936.00 which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and appropriate, and recommends that the Commission approve the award of the contract to CMT based on its technical proposal for Project No. 71-22-09; and

WHEREAS, the Commission’s Director of Contracts Administration has determined that the LOI process and the selection of CMT conforms with the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 to 153.71, that all legal requirements were performed and that the proposals were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions with respect to all respondents and potential respondents; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion determined that CMT has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 20% which meets the SBE participation goal of 20% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation of the Chief Engineer and concurs that the Commission should approve the selection of CMT to perform Professional Engineering Services for Project No. 71-22-09; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution seeks authorization of Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$146,936.00 but the contract includes additional Phase I Services and Phase II Services, and Commission staff will modify the contract in accordance with the Commission's contracts policy to include those additional services at the time they are necessary for successful completion of the Project, including presenting a resolution to the Commission if required; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the selection of Crawford, Murphy & Tilly, Inc. is approved as the most qualified firm to perform the design services and engineering support during construction necessary for Project No. 71-22-09, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract with Crawford, Murphy & Tilly for Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$146,936.00.

(Resolution No. 13-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of ms consultants, inc. for Project No. 71-22-11 in the Total Amount of \$173,484.00

WHEREAS, on August 24, 2022, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) issued Request for Letters of Interest No. 14-2022 seeking letters of interest for design services and engineering support during construction for Project No. 71-22-11, Deck Replacement of the Ohio Turnpike Bridge over Ohio Turnpike Ramp at Milepost 162.0, and Deck Replacement of the State Route 94 Bridge (State Road) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 167.3, both in Cuyahoga County, Ohio (the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, on September 14, 2022, Letters of Interest were received from seven (7) firms expressing their readiness to serve as the Commission’s engineering consultant for Project No. 71-22-11; and

WHEREAS, on the basis of the proposals received, in accordance with the Commission’s Standard Operating Procedure for Professional Design Consultant Selection Process, the Engineering staff concluded that ms consultants, inc., is the most qualified firm to perform the necessary services for Project No. 71-22-11, and conducted a Scope of Services meeting to confirm a mutual understanding of the Phase IA Services for the Project consisting of site inspection, field survey, base mapping, maintenance of traffic evaluation, utility location, stakeholder outreach/ODOT coordination, load rating, and engineering report (“Phase IA Services”); and

WHEREAS, ms consultants, inc. submitted its revised fee proposal dated January 9, 2023, to perform the Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$173,484.00 which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and appropriate, and recommends that the Commission approve the award of the contract to ms consultants, inc. based on its technical proposal for Project No. 71-22-11; and

WHEREAS, the Commission’s Director of Contracts Administration has determined that the LOI process and the selection of ms consultants, inc. conforms with the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 to 153.71, that all legal requirements were performed and that the proposals were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions with respect to all respondents and potential respondents; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion determined that ms consultants, inc. has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 20% which meets the SBE participation goal of 20% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation of the Chief Engineer and concurs that the Commission should approve the selection of ms consultants, inc. to perform the Phase IA Services for Project No. 71-22-11; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary to approve the contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Bylaws because ms consultants, inc.'s revised fee proposal to perform the Phase IA Services exceeds \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution seeks authorization of Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$173,484.00 but the contract includes additional Phase I Services and Phase II Services, and Commission staff will modify the contract in accordance with the Commission's contracts policy to include those additional services at the time they are necessary for successful completion of the Project, including presenting a resolution to the Commission if required; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the selection of ms consultants, inc. is approved as the most qualified firm to perform the design services and engineering support during construction necessary for Project No. 71-22-11, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract with ms consultants, inc. for Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$173,484.00.

(Resolution No. 14-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. for Project No. 71-22-12 in the Total Amount of \$133,690.00

WHEREAS, on August 24, 2022, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) issued a Request for Letters of Interest No. 15-2022 seeking letters of interest for design services and engineering support during construction for Project No. 71-22-12, Deck Replacement of the Ohio Turnpike Bridge over Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 180.3, Deck Replacement of the Prospect Road Bridge (County Route 142) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 182.1, and Deck Replacement of the State Route 91 Bridge (Darrow Road) over the Ohio Turnpike Mainline at Milepost 183.2, all in Summit County, Ohio (the “Project”); and

WHEREAS, on September 14, 2022, Letters of Interest were received from seven (7) firms expressing their readiness to serve as the Commission’s engineering consultant for Project No. 71-22-12; and

WHEREAS, on the basis of the proposals received, in accordance with the Commission’s Standard Operating Procedure for Professional Design Consultant Selection Process, the Engineering staff concluded that American Structurepoint, Inc., is the most qualified firm to perform the necessary services for Project No. 71-22-12, and conducted a Scope of Services meeting to confirm a mutual understanding of the Phase IA Services for the Project consisting of bridge inspection, field survey, base mapping, maintenance of traffic evaluation, utility location stakeholder outreach/ODOT coordination, load rating, and engineering report (“Phase IA Services”); and

WHEREAS, American Structurepoint, Inc. submitted its revised fee proposal dated February 1, 2023, to perform the Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$133,690.00 which fee proposal the Chief Engineer deemed reasonable and appropriate, and recommends that the Commission approve the award of the contract to American Structurepoint, Inc. based on its technical proposal for Project No. 71-22-12; and

WHEREAS, the Commission’s Director of Contracts Administration has determined that the LOI process and the selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. conforms with the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 to 153.71, that all legal requirements were performed and that the proposals were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions with respect to all respondents and potential respondents; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion determined that American Structurepoint, Inc. has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the Project and has made a commitment of 20% which meets the SBE participation goal of 20% for the Project; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the recommendation of the Chief Engineer and concurs that the Commission should approve the selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. to perform the Phase IA Services for Project No. 71-22-12; and

WHEREAS, this Resolution seeks authorization of Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$133,690.00 but the contract includes additional Phase I Services and Phase II Services, and Commission staff will modify the contract in accordance with the Commission's contracts policy to include those additional services at the time they are necessary for successful completion of the Project, including presenting a resolution to the Commission if required; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the selection of American Structurepoint, Inc. is approved as the most qualified firm to perform the design services and engineering support during construction necessary for Project No. 71-22-12, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract with American Structurepoint, Inc. for Phase IA Services in the not-to-exceed amount of \$133,690.00.

(Resolution No. 15-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron in the Total Amount of \$277,150.80 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program

WHEREAS, the Executive Director of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) is authorized to participate in state contracts through the Ohio Department of Administrative Services (“DAS”) Cooperative Purchasing Program, through which members may purchase supplies, services, equipment and other materials in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 125.04; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer has determined that it is necessary to purchase new Sport Utility Vehicles “SUVs” to be used for operating and maintaining the Ohio Turnpike and to replace existing vehicles that have reached the end of their viable economic life and recommend for disposal under the Commission’s Property Disposal Policy; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer recommends that the best equipment available to perform its operations is six (6) 2023 Ford Explorer AWD “SUVs”; and

WHEREAS, six (6) 2023 Ford Explorer AWD SUVs are available for acquisition through the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, under DAS Contract No. RS1011029 (Index No. GDC093, Item 2AT-1) from Valley Ford of Huron of Huron, Ohio in the total amount of \$277,150.80; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director and Chief Engineer concurs with the recommendation of the Chief Engineer that the Commission approve the purchase of Six (6) Ford Explorer SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron of Huron, Ohio, under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program in the total amount of \$277,150.80; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the expenditure required to purchase the above-listed vehicles exceeds \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the purchase of the six (6) Ford Explorer SUVs from Valley Ford of Huron of Huron, Ohio, under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, Contract No. RS 1011029 in the total amount of \$277,150.80, is approved.

(Resolution No. 16-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Three (3) Cargo Vans from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$170,721.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program

WHEREAS, the Executive Director of the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) is authorized to participate in state contracts through the Ohio Department of Administrative Services (“DAS”) Cooperative Purchasing Program, through which members may purchase supplies, services, equipment and other materials in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 125.04; and

WHEREAS, the Chief Information Officer and the Maintenance Operations Engineer has determined that it is necessary to purchase new cargo vans to be used for operating and maintaining the Ohio Turnpike and to replace existing vehicles that have reached the end of their viable economic life and recommend for disposal under the Commission’s Property Disposal Policy; and

WHEREAS, the Chief Information Officer and the Maintenance Operations Engineer recommends that the best equipment available to perform its operations is three (3) 2023 Ford Transit Cargo Vans; and

WHEREAS, three (3) Ford Transit Cargo Vans are available for acquisition through the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, under DAS Contract No. RS1010870 (Index No. GDC093, Item 7AT-130-1) from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. of Cleveland, Ohio in the total amount of \$170,721.00; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director and Chief Engineer concurs with the recommendation of the Chief Information Officer and the Maintenance Operations Engineer that the Commission approve the purchase of three (3) Ford Transit Cargo Vans under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program in the total amount of \$170,721.00, from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. of Cleveland, Ohio; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the expenditure required to purchase the vehicles exceeds \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the purchase of three (3) Ford Transit Cargo Vans under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, Contract No. RS1010870 (Index No. GDC093, Item 7AT-130-1) in the total amount of \$170,721.00 from Valley Ford Truck, Inc. of Cleveland, Ohio, is approved.

(Resolution No. 17-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Six (6) Malibu Midsize Sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc. in the Total Amount of \$177,270.00 Under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program

WHEREAS, the Executive Director is authorized to participate in state contracts through the Ohio Department of Administrative Services (“DAS”) Cooperative Purchasing Program, through which members may purchase supplies, services, equipment and other materials in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 125.04; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer has determined that it is necessary to purchase new midsize sedans to be used for operating and maintaining the Ohio Turnpike and to replace existing vehicles that have reached the end of their viable economic life and recommend for disposal under the Commission’s Property Disposal Policy; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer recommends that the best equipment available to perform its operations is six (6) 2024 Chevrolet Malibu Midsize Sedans; and

WHEREAS, six (6) midsize sedans are available for acquisition through the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, under DAS Contract No. RS1010229 (Index No. GDC104, Item 2AA-1) from Valley Chevrolet of Wellington, Ohio in the total amount of \$177,270.00; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director and Chief Engineer concurs with the recommendation of the Maintenance Operations Engineer that the Commission approve the purchase of six (6) 2024 Chevrolet Malibu Midsize Sedans from Valley Chevrolet, Inc., under the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is necessary under Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the expenditure required to purchase the vehicles exceeds \$150,000.00; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendations.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the purchase of the six (6) midsize sedans through the DAS Cooperative Purchasing Program, under DAS Contract No. RS1010229 (Index No. GDC104, Item 2AA-1) from Valley Chevrolet of Wellington, Ohio in the total amount of \$177,270.00, is approved.

(Resolution No. 18-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Authorizing the Selection of Crafc0, Inc. for Joint Sealant Under Bid Invitation No. 4424 in the Total Amount of \$286,440.00

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) advertised an Invitation for Bids to furnish the approximate quantity of 550,000 pounds of hot-pour, ready-mixed joint sealant under Invitation No. 4424; and

WHEREAS, the Commission received three (3) bids in response to the Invitation, and the Commission’s Maintenance Operations Engineer reviewed and analyzed the timely bids submitted, whose report concerning such analysis is before the Commission; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer reports that Crafc0, Inc. (“Crafc0”), of Chandler, Arizona, submitted the apparent low bid at a unit price of \$0.4960 per pound; and

WHEREAS, the Maintenance Operations Engineer reports that the bid of Crafc0 conforms with the bid specifications in all material respects, observed that Crafc0 has satisfactorily furnished similar material previously to the Commission, and recommends that the Commission select the bid of Crafc0 as the lowest responsible and responsive bid received under Invitation No. 4424, in the amount of \$0.4960 per pound, which may result in a total contract price of \$286,440.00 if the maximum delivery variance of five percent from the approximate quantity of 550,000 pounds is reached; and

WHEREAS, the Commission’s Director of Contracts Administration has determined that the bids for Invitation No. 4424 were solicited on the basis of the same terms and conditions and the same specifications, and that the bid from Crafc0 for Invitation No. 4424 conforms to the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Section 5537.07 and 9.312; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion determined to waive the program requirements due to a lack of subcontractor opportunity and availability of certified firms; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director and Chief Engineer have reviewed the report of the Maintenance Operations Engineer and concurs with the recommendation to award the contract for Invitation No. 4424 to Crafc0 as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder; and

WHEREAS, Commission action is requested to approve the contract in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission’s Code of Bylaws because the amount of the bid received will require an expenditure that exceeds \$150,000.00 to furnish the joint sealant material; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid of Crafc0, Inc. under Invitation No. 4424, to deliver an approximate quantity of 550,000 pounds of hot-pour, ready-mixed joint sealant for its bid price of \$0.4960 per pound, which will result in a total contract

price of \$286,440.00 if the maximum delivery variance of five percent from the approximate quantity of 550,000 pounds is reached, is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received, and that the Executive Director is authorized to execute a contract on the basis of said bid.

(Resolution No. 19-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4422 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 89 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$312,800.00

WHEREAS, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) duly advertised for bids under Invitation No. 4422 for the furnishing of all services and materials for cleaning certain Commission Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Posts for an initial term including the remainder of 2023, with the option to renew for two possible one-year renewal terms; and

WHEREAS, the Commission received one bid in response to perform cleaning services at certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Posts, specifically Interchanges 2 through 91, including new Toll Plazas 4 and 49, and the Swanton Patrol Post 89 from Any Domestic Work, Inc. (“ADW”), of Parma, Ohio; and

WHEREAS, the Western District Toll Supervisor has reported that the following company submitted the lowest responsive and responsible bid as follows:

<u>Company</u>	<u>Monthly Fee</u>	<u>Hourly Rate*</u>
Any Domestic Work, Inc.	\$9,200.00	\$18.00
Total Award	\$312,800.00	

*The hourly rate applies to services and supplies for requested services beyond the specified contracted scope

WHEREAS, the estimated cost of the Contract for the remainder of 2023 is \$92,000.00; and the estimated combined cost for the two possible one-year renewal terms is \$220,800.00; the combined cost over the proposed term is \$312,800.00, subject to possible adjustments as provided for in the Bid Invitation and the form contract; and

WHEREAS, the Director of Contracts Administration has determined that all bids were solicited on the basis of the same terms, conditions and specifications, and that ADW complied with the requirements of Section 5537.07 and 9.312 of the Ohio Revised Code, and submitted a performance bond with good and sufficient surety; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion has determined that ADW with respect to its bid for services has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the contracts and that 5% SBE participation will be performed by Pristine Chemical LLC, a Commission certified vendor; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the bid award recommendation of the Western District Toll Supervisor and recommends that a Contract be awarded to ADW as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for under Invitation No. 4422; and

WHEREAS, expenditures by the Commission under Invitation No. 4422 will exceed \$150,000.00, and, therefore, in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Code of Bylaws, Commission action is necessary for the award of such contract to ADW; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendation.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid received under Invitation No. 4422 from Any Domestic Work, Inc. of Parma, Ohio, is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bids received to perform cleaning services at certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Posts, specifically Interchanges 2 through 91, including new Toll Plazas 4 and 49, and the Swanton Patrol Post 89, and that the Executive Director is authorized to enter into a contract on the basis of said bid for an initial term including the remainder of 2023, with the option to renew for two possible one-year renewal terms, for an estimated total amount of \$312,800.00 for the contract term, subject to possible rate adjustments as provided for under Invitation No. 4422 and the form contract.

(Resolution No. 20-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)

OHIO TURNPIKE AND INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION

Resolution Approving the Selection of Any Domestic Work, Inc. Under Bid Invitation No. 4428 to Perform Cleaning Services at Certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Post 91 in the Total Estimated Amount of \$286,280.00

WHEREAS, in 2022, the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission (“Commission”) duly advertised for bids under Invitation No. 4420 for the furnishing of all services and materials for cleaning certain Commission Toll Plazas and an Ohio State Highway Patrol Post, initial term including the remainder of 2023, with the option to renew for two possible one-year renewal terms; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to Resolution No. 99-2022, adopted December 19, 2022, the Commission rejected the sole bid received from American Maintenance Service, Inc. under Invitation No. 4420 because the bid did not address Ohio’s minimum wage increase, effective January 1, 2023. When Commission staff requested additional information regarding the minimum wage increase, American Maintenance Service, Inc.’s pricing increased by more than 35%; and

WHEREAS, the Commission received three bids in response to Invitation No. 4428 to perform cleaning services at certain Toll Plazas and Ohio State Highway Patrol Posts, specifically Interchanges 180 through 239, including new Toll Plaza 211, and the Hiram Patrol Post 91 from Mahoning Valley Cleaning Company, LLC., Any Domestic Work, Inc. (“ADW”) and American Maintenance Service, Inc.; and

WHEREAS, the bid submitted by Mahoning Valley Cleaning Company, LLC was deemed nonresponsive and rejected for failure to submit a bid bond which was required under the Bid Invitation; and

WHEREAS, the Western District Toll Supervisor has reported that the following company submitted the lowest responsive and responsible bid as follows:

<u>Company</u>	<u>Monthly Fee</u>	<u>Hourly Rate*</u>
Any Domestic Work, Inc.	\$8,420.00	\$20.00
Total Award	\$286,280.00	

*The hourly rate applies to services and supplies for requested services beyond the specified contracted scope

WHEREAS, the estimated cost of the Contract for the remainder of 2023 is \$84,200.00; and the estimated combined cost for the two possible one-year renewal terms is \$202,080.00; the combined cost over the proposed term is \$286,280.00, subject to possible adjustments as provided for in the Bid Invitation and the form contract; and

WHEREAS, the Director of Contracts Administration has determined that all bids were solicited on the basis of the same terms, conditions and specifications, and that ADW complied with the requirements of Section 5537.07 and 9.312 of the Ohio Revised Code, and submitted a performance bond with good and sufficient surety; and

WHEREAS, the Office of Equity and Inclusion has determined that ADW with respect to its bid for services has made a good faith effort to attain the participation of small or otherwise disadvantaged businesses on the contracts and that 3% SBE participation will be performed by Pristine Chemical LLC, a Commission certified vendor; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Director has reviewed the bid award recommendation of the Western District Toll Supervisor and recommends that a Contract be awarded to ADW as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder for under Invitation No. 4428; and

WHEREAS, expenditures by the Commission under Invitation No. 4428 will exceed \$150,000.00, and, therefore, in accordance with Article V, Section 1.00 of the Commission's Code of Bylaws, Commission action is necessary for the award of such contract to ADW; and

WHEREAS, the Commission has duly considered such recommendation.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, by the Ohio Turnpike and Infrastructure Commission that the bid received under Invitation No. 4428 from Any Domestic Work, Inc. of Parma, Ohio, is approved as the lowest responsive and responsible bid received to perform cleaning services at certain Toll Plazas and an Ohio State Highway Patrol Post, specifically Interchanges 180 through 239, including new Toll Plaza 211, and the Hiram Patrol Post 91 and that the Executive Director is authorized to enter into a contract on the basis of said bid for an initial term including the remainder of 2023, with the option to renew for two possible one-year renewal terms, for an estimated total amount of \$286,280.00 for the contract term, subject to possible rate adjustments as provided for under Invitation No. 4428 and the form contract.

(Resolution No. 21-2023 adopted February 21, 2023)